

Exploration of the Implementation of Learning to Write Procedural Texts and its Implications for Student Learning Outcomes

Zulhafizah Redhya^{1*}, St. Nurbaya²
Yogyakarta State University

Corresponding Author: Zulhafizah Redhya
zulhafizahredhya.2022@student.uny.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Exploration, Writing Skills, Procedure Text

Received : 14, August

Revised : 26, August

Accepted: 27, September

©2024 Redhya, Nurbaya : This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Atribusi 4.0 Internasional](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

This study aims to (1) describe the implementation of learning to write procedural texts, including the use of models, materials, media, and learning evaluation; and (2) describe student learning outcomes related to the use of these models, materials, media, and evaluations. This research is qualitative with an exploratory study design, involving teachers and seventh-grade students at three junior high schools in Yogyakarta. Data collection techniques include observation, interviews, document analysis, and literature study, with data analysis through reduction, modeling, and drawing conclusions. The research results show that two learning models are used, namely project-based learning and problem-based learning. Some teaching materials follow textbooks, while others are developed based on local culture. The media used are varied, including visual, audio-visual, and internet-based media. Learning evaluation uses attitudinal, formative, and summative assessments. The use of project-based learning and audio-visual media is more effective in increasing student motivation, creativity, and learning outcomes.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesian language subjects have a crucial role in daily life and individual development. Mastering Indonesian allows a person to communicate effectively, convey ideas clearly, and understand information from various sources. In academics, good language skills help in reading, writing, and critical thinking, which are the foundation for learning in many disciplines. In social and professional contexts, good language skills facilitate more harmonious and efficient interactions, support success in business communications, and expand access to information and media. In line with this, Klimova (2014) and Karunasree & Francis (2020) also stated that by mastering Indonesian language lessons, someone can get a good job. This is because currently many jobs require and prioritize people with good writing skills to help them in creating contracts or work documents. Thus, Indonesian language lessons are not only important for mastering the language itself but also for broader personal and professional development.

Writing generally refers to a person's efforts to create or produce written messages. Writing is a cognitive activity in which people convey ideas, thoughts, feelings, opinions and experiences in written form. However, in reality writing is not an easy thing. The following research shows the reasons why students have difficulty writing, including research from Saudi Arabia by Mohammad and Hazarika (2016) which shows that a lack of interest and motivation to write is one of the reasons students experience difficulty writing. Apart from that, research by Dar and Khan (2015) and Haider (2012) from Pakistan shows that many factors cause students to have difficulty writing, including from the academic background and personal interests of the writer to various psychological, linguistic and cognitive phenomena. . Then research by Li and Razali (2019) from Malaysia and Safa (2018) from Iran, shows that one of the variables that contributes to students' low writing skills is the use of inappropriate or ineffective models and methods in learning.

One of the writing skills that must be learned in class VII SMP/MTs in the even semester according to the independent curriculum is writing procedural texts. Gerot and Wignell (1995:206) define procedure text as a text that describes the process (stages) in completing a task. In addition, according to Gerot and Wignell, procedure texts are designed to provide instructions on how to carry out tasks according to existing systematics. The structure seen in the procedure text is that there is a title, there is a goal, there is a list of tools and materials, there are implementation stages, observations and conclusions (Mahsun, 2014: 30). In an educational context, procedure texts are a powerful tool for strengthening students' critical thinking skills, conceptual understanding, speaking and writing abilities. Therefore, writing procedure texts is one of several important subjects studied by students.

There are four components that are inseparable in the learning process, namely the use of models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluation. These four components are important components in teaching and learning activities and play an important role in achieving more effective learning. Choosing the right models, teaching materials, media and evaluation can help

students understand subjects and improve their learning achievements. Born et al. (2017) conducted research that supports this hypothesis. The results of the research show that using the right model can improve student learning achievement in their courses. Furthermore, research by Yu-Feng Lan, Chun-Ling Hung, and Hung-Ju Hsu (2011) shows that the use of well-organized and appropriate media can increase the success of students' writing learning. Then Wahyudi, Hariyadi, and Hariani (2014) found that teaching materials, if used appropriately, could increase the success of the learning process in the classroom. Furthermore, the importance of evaluation in learning is shown by research by Magdalena, Fauzi, and Putri (2020). His research shows that a well-designed evaluation system will be able to provide an overview of the quality of learning and enable teachers to plan learning tactics more effectively. A good and appropriate evaluation system can provide motivation for students to continue to improve their learning outcomes.

Based on researchers' observations and interviews with Indonesian language teachers who teach at Junior High Schools (SMP) in Yogyakarta, the models, teaching materials, media and learning evaluations used are different. The use of different models, teaching materials, media and learning evaluations produces results output different learning too. Thus, the problem in this research is how procedural text learning is seen from these four components and their implications for learning outcomes.

Through this research, an attempt will be made to explore the learning process of writing procedural texts in three junior high schools in Yogyakarta. The assessment focuses on the four learning components, namely models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluation and will highlight student responses and participation in these four components. By looking at learning outcomes and student responses, strengths and potential improvements can be identified in the subsequent learning process. Then, it is hoped that the results of this research can provide a valuable contribution in providing guidance or references for teachers and schools to design innovative procedural text learning that suits students' needs.

THEORETICAL REVIEW

Procedure Text Writing Skills

According to Gerot and Wignell (1995: 206), procedure text is a type of text that explains how to complete a task by following certain steps. In other words, procedure texts contain step-by-step instructions for carrying out something. They also added that procedure texts are designed to provide guidance on how a process must be carried out in accordance with a predetermined systematicity. Apart from that, Mahsun (2014: 30) believes that procedural texts aim to guide or teach someone in doing or making something according to predetermined steps.

A procedure text consists of five main components: title, objectives, materials and tools, steps, and conclusion. In terms of language, procedure texts have seven distinctive characteristics, namely (1) the use of command sentences, (2) passive forms to explain processes, (3) criteria or limitations, (4)

adverbs that explain methods, tools and objectives, (5) suggestions or prohibitions, (6) connecting words, references and omissions, and (7) use of the endings -i and -kan (Harsiati et al., 2017: 107-112). Procedure texts can be divided into three types, namely (1) procedure texts that guide the use or use of tools (such as how to play a musical instrument or use a tool), (2) procedure texts that guide the manufacturing process (including materials, methods and steps), and (3) procedural texts that guide the implementation of certain activities (such as how to dance or do gymnastics) (Harsiati et al., 2017: 91).

Learning Model

A learning model is a framework or strategy used by teachers to convey lesson material to students so that learning becomes more effective and efficient. The learning model is designed based on education and learning theory, and adapted to the needs, characteristics and learning objectives. In line with this, Trianto (2011: 51) defines a learning model as a plan or pattern that functions as a guide for learning in the classroom. Using the right learning model can make the teaching and learning process more effective and enjoyable, as well as increase students' understanding and abilities.

Teaching Materials

Teaching materials play a very important role in learning because they provide a structured and relevant source of information to achieve educational goals. Good teaching materials are designed to support students' learning process by providing clear explanations, concrete examples, and useful exercises, making it easier to understand the concepts being taught. In addition, appropriate teaching materials that are guided by the curriculum and student needs can help create an organized and focused learning experience, allowing students to absorb information more effectively. With standardized and planned teaching materials, teachers can deliver material more consistently and systematically, while students get the tools needed to explore and master learning topics. Ultimately, teaching materials function as a bridge between theory and practice, supporting in-depth learning and facilitating the achievement of optimal learning outcomes. According to Sudiati and Nurhidayah (2017), teaching materials have various types, both printed and non-printed. Printed teaching materials include books, modules and handouts. Non-print teaching materials include audio, audio-visual and interactive multimedia teaching materials.

Instructional Media

Learning media are tools used to communicate learning material to students (Pringgawidagda, 2002: 145). Arsyad (2011: 3) also stated that media in the learning process is often identified as graphic, image or electronic tools to capture, process and reconstruct visual or verbal information. When teaching language, teachers can use audio, text, still visuals, moving visuals, semi-moving audio, still audio visuals, and moving audio visuals (Bretz, 2010).

Learning Evaluation

Learning evaluation is a systematic process of collecting, analyzing and interpreting information or data on students' abilities to determine how far they can achieve educational goals (Gronlund, 1985: 5). Apart from contributing to objectives, designing learning experiences, and assessing student performance, learning evaluation is very useful for bringing improvements in pursuits and curriculum (Ifeoma, 2022: 120). So, it can be said that evaluation in learning plays a crucial role because it allows measuring the effectiveness of the teaching and learning process as well as student progress. By conducting regular evaluations, teachers can assess the extent to which students understand the material being taught and identify areas that require more attention. This allows for more focused and adaptive teaching, so it can address each student's strengths and weaknesses. Additionally, evaluations provide constructive feedback to students, helping them recognize mistakes and correct them, while motivating them to continue learning. Through data obtained from evaluations, learning planning can be adjusted to meet individual student needs and improve the overall quality of education.

METHODOLOGY

This research is qualitative research that uses an exploratory research design. The data in this research comes from primary and secondary data. Primary data was collected through observation and conversations (interviews) with teachers and students, while secondary data came from books, teaching modules, journal articles and other scientific publications. The subjects in this research were Indonesian language subject teachers and class VII students from three junior high schools (SMP) in Yogyakarta. The object of this research is the use of models, teaching materials, media, and evaluation in learning to write procedural texts for class VII SMP in 2024.

This research data was collected using observation techniques, interviews, document analysis and literature review. Observations were carried out by following the learning process carried out in class; interviews were conducted with class VII Indonesian language teachers with the aim of exploring information related to learning procedural texts; Document analysis was carried out to obtain data (student scores) related to the implementation of learning to write procedural texts; Meanwhile, a literature study was carried out to examine in more detail the concept of models, teaching materials, media and learning evaluation. The data analysis technique in this research follows the interactive analysis paradigm of Miles and Huberman (via Emzir, 2012), which is carried out through three types of activities, namely data reduction, data modeling, and drawing/verifying conclusions.

RESULTS

This research aims to explore, study and describe the models, teaching materials, media and learning evaluations used during learning to write procedural texts in several schools in Yogyakarta. Based on the results of previous observations and interviews, the types of models, teaching materials,

media and learning evaluations used in learning to write procedural texts in class VII of State Middle Schools in Yogyakarta are as follows.

Table 1. Implementation of Learning to Write Procedure Texts at Junior High School (SMP) in Yogyakarta

No	School name	Implementation of Learning Writing Procedure Text			
		Model Learning	Material Lesson	Media Learning	Evaluation Learning
1	SMPN 1 Yogyakarta	<i>Project Based Learning (PjBL)</i>	Teaching materials are adapted to textbooks.	LKPD, PPT, learning videos, textbooks, internet (<i>canva, youtube, google</i>)	a. Attitude assessment b. Formative assessment c. Summative assessment
2	SMPN 6 Yogyakarta	<i>Problem Based Learning (PBL)</i>	Teaching materials are adapted from textbooks plus material related to regional culture.	PPT, learning videos, internet (<i>google</i>), package book	a. Attitude assessment b. Formative assessment c. Summative assessment
3	SMPN 8 Yogyakarta	<i>Project Based Learning (PjBL)</i>	Teaching materials are adapted to textbooks and developed in accordance with ATP.	Clippings, PPT, props, internet (<i>google and youtube</i>)	a. Attitude assessment b. Formative assessment c. Summative assessment

DISCUSSION

Planning and Implementation of Learning to Write Procedure Texts

The implementation of learning in each school is different depending on how the teacher designs the learning. In organizing classroom learning, teachers can choose models, teaching materials, media and types of evaluation that are appropriate for students so that learning objectives can be achieved. The use of models, teaching materials, media, and types of learning evaluation are adapted to student needs and are guided by the current curriculum (independent curriculum).

Planning the use of models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluation is one of the activities that needs to be carried out by a teacher to create effectiveness and success in the learning process. Based on the results of observations, interviews and document analysis, each class VII SMPN teacher in Yogyakarta carried out different learning implementations in writing procedural texts. Planning for the use of models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluation are arranged in teaching modules. The teaching module becomes a reference in implementing learning.

Planning and implementation of learning to write procedural texts must be carried out systematically and structured. With good planning and effective implementation, students can master the skills of writing procedural texts well. This not only helps students understand how to compose clear and organized text, but also develops critical thinking and skills problem-solving the important one. Through this process, students learn how to detail the steps in a procedure, organize information logically, and communicate instructions effectively. This ability is very useful in various contexts, both academic and in everyday life, where they are often faced with situations that require the delivery of instructions or the creation of systematic documents. Apart from that, good procedural text writing skills also support improved communication and analytical skills, which in turn can increase students' confidence in completing writing-based assignments in the future.

Types of Models, Teaching Materials, Media, and Evaluation in Learning Learning Model

Based on the results of observations, interviews and document analysis, the types of learning models used by teachers in learning to write procedural texts for class VII students in the three SMPNs in Yogyakarta vary. SMPN 1 Yogyakarta and SMPN 8 Yogyakarta use the model PjBL, while SMPN 6 Yogyakarta uses the PBL model. Model PjBL is a model that involves projects at the teaching and learning stage. This project can be done by students independently or in groups over a certain period of time collaboratively, creating a product, and then presenting or displaying it in front of the class. The focus of learning lies in projects that involve students in their investigations. Students learn by asking questions, debating ideas, designing plans, and communicating with others. An important component of project-based learning is the existence of questions that direct students to activities and the existence of a final product that is formed by students (Rusman, 2017: 395; Barak & Yuan, 2021; Choi et al., 2019). In contrast to PjBL, model PBL is the model that makes the problem as a focal point for developing knowledge, self-control and problem-solving skills (Eggen & Kauchack, 2012: 354). PBL problems relate to complex real-world situations and have several possible solutions (Arends, 2008: 397). PBL real-world situations serve as the first catalyst for the development of students' critical thinking skills (Westcott, Whitcombe, & Matheson, 2010: 9-10).

The use of learning models in the three schools varies, as does their implementation. As stated previously, SMPN 1 Yogyakarta uses a model PjBL in learning to write procedure texts. The learning process begins by providing

examples of procedural texts which are presented in the form of learning videos. After that, the teacher presents the material through power point Canva based which is displayed on the whiteboard. Then, the teacher organizes students into several groups to plan the creation of projects (products) according to the given theme and then present them in front of the class. During the process of working on the project, the teacher monitors students and guides students in completing the project. When the project is complete (writing the procedure text), it is assessed according to the assessment indicators. Not only that, after the procedure text has been written, students practice according to the procedure text that has been written.

Furthermore, SMPN 8 Yogyakarta also uses the model PjBL in learning to write procedure texts. Learning begins with display power point which contains learning material. The teacher explains the material and examples of procedure-based texts power point is displayed. Before writing the procedure text, the teacher divides students according to the themes they are interested in (applying differentiated learning). After the students are divided according to the themes they are interested in, the teacher asks the students to make clippings so they can get to know the procedure text. After that, students are instructed to create procedure texts. When the procedure text has been written, it will be assessed according to the assessment indicators.

This is different from SMPN 6 Yogyakarta, the model used in learning to write procedural texts is a model PBL. Learning begins with the teacher providing orientation about the problem to students in the form of showing a video about how to do or make something via a projector in front of the class, then the teacher and students ask each other questions and answers regarding the information contained in the video. After that, the teacher organizes students to research/discuss in groups regarding the draft procedure text writing. The teacher guides students during the discussion process. When the draft procedure text has been completed, students develop it and present it in front of the class, then the teacher evaluates the procedure text that the student has written.

Teaching Materials

Based on the results of observations, interviews and document analysis, the teaching materials used in each school are almost the same. The three schools both use teaching resources based on Indonesian language package books from the Ministry of Education and Culture. However, at SMPN 6 Yogyakarta, teaching materials are created using regional culture. This means that at SMPN 1 Yogyakarta and SMPN 8 Yogyakarta, the teaching materials used come from textbooks which are processed by the teachers concerned into modules or handout without adding elements of local regional culture. However, at SMPN 6 Yogyakarta the teaching materials were further developed by adding regional culture such as including regional food or musical instruments, but still guided by the textbook.

Instructional Media

Based on the results of observations, observations and document analysis, Each school uses different learning media. At SMPN 1 Yogyakarta, there are

three types of media used in learning to write procedural texts, namely visual media (LKPD, power point, and textbooks), audio-visual media (learning videos), and internet-based (canva, youtube, and google). SMPN 6 Yogyakarta also uses three types of media, namely visual media (package books and power point), audio visual (learning videos), and internet-based media (google). Then, at SMPN 8 Yogyakarta, the learning media used is visual media in the form of power point, clippings, textbooks, and teaching aids as well as internet-based media in the form of google.

Learning Evaluation

Based on interviews and observations that have been carried out, the types of learning evaluation used in learning to write procedural texts in all three schools are the same, namely using attitudinal, formative and summative assessments (evaluations). Assessment of student attitudes is based on an assessment rubric that is guided by the characteristics of Pancasila students. Formative assessment takes the form of assignments in compiling procedural texts. In these three schools, formative assessment is carried out twice, namely an assessment of group work and an individual assessment. Finally, summative assessment takes the form of giving questions at the end of the lesson. The summative assessment consists of ordinary multiple choice questions and complex multiple choice questions. Formative and summative assessments are guided by previously established assessment rubrics.

Student Learning Results on the Use of Models, Materials, Media, and Learning Evaluation

Based on the results of document analysis, it can be seen that students' writing scores regarding the use of models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluation are as follows.

Table 2. Skill Values for Writing Procedure Texts
Students at Junior High School (SMP) in Yogyakarta

No.	School name	Average Student Writing Score		
		Class A	Class B	Class C
1	SMPN 1 Yogyakarta	86,6	88,5	87,4
2	SMPN 6 Yogyakarta	89,4	89,5	90,3
3	SMPN 8 Yogyakarta	86	82,6	85,5

In table two above, it can be seen that each school obtained different writing learning outcomes according to the model, teaching materials, media and learning evaluation used. Of the three schools, the average scores obtained by students from highest to lowest were obtained by SMPN 6 Yogyakarta, SMPN 1 Yogyakarta, and SMPN 8 Yogyakarta. Even though the writing scores obtained by students at each school are different, overall the results are satisfactory, because obtaining these scores cannot be separated from several factors that influence them.

Apart from the value of writing skills, based on the results of observations during the learning process it can be seen that the use of the PjBL model and

audio-visual media has a large positive impact on learning to write compared to other models and media. This is proven by students who are more active, creative and motivated in learning.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the research results and discussion above, the following can be concluded. First, the types of models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluations used in learning to write procedure texts in class VII of State Middle Schools in Yogyakarta vary. There are two types of learning models used, namely the PjBL and PBL models. Then, in terms of the use of teaching materials, some follow textbooks and some are developed according to regional culture. In terms of learning media, there are seven media that teachers vary in each procedural text lesson, which can be categorized into visual, audio-visual and internet-based media. Furthermore, in terms of learning evaluation, all schools use the same learning evaluation, namely attitude assessment, formative assessment and summative assessment. Second, the selection and use of different types of models, teaching materials, media, and learning evaluation results output different learning too. The use of the PjBL model and audio-visual media is more effective than other models and media in terms of motivating and increasing student creativity. Third, it is hoped that the implications of the results of the exploration of models, teaching materials, media and learning evaluation can become references in learning to write, especially writing procedural texts.

FURTHER STUDY

This research is only limited to the scope of the use of models, teaching materials, media, and evaluation in learning to write procedural texts. For further research, other researchers can deepen it by exploring the types of models, teaching materials, media, and evaluations used in various other types of texts so that it can be known what types of learning devices are effective for use in various texts studied.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The researcher expresses his sincere appreciation to all parties who have contributed to writing this article. Thanks to Dr. Dra. St. Nurbaya, M. Hum., M.Si. who has provided guidance and direction during the research process. Thank you also to colleagues who have worked dedicatedly to ensure the quality and accuracy of the information in this article. Finally, thanks are also expressed to the principal, teachers and students who have made the research data collection process easier and helpful. Support from readers and constructive feedback are also very meaningful for researchers in improving and perfecting this article. Hopefully this article can provide benefits and become a useful reference for readers.

REFERENCES

- Arends, R.I. (2008). *Learning to Teach: Belajar untuk Mengajar*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar.
- Arsyad, A. (2011). *Media Pembelajaran*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.

- Barak, M., & Yuan, S. (2021). A cultural perspective to project-based learning and the cultivation of innovative thinking: Thinking Skills and Creativity. Elsevier, 39. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2020.100766>
- Bretz, R. (2010). A Taxonomy of Communication Media. Education Technology Publication. Englewood: Cliffs, N.J.
- Choi, J., Lee, J. H., & Kim, B. (2019). How does learner-centered education affect teacher self-efficacy? The case of project-based learning in Korea. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 85, 45-57. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.05.005>
- Dar, M. F., & Khan, I. (2015). Writing anxiety among public and private sectors Pakistani undergraduate university students. *Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies*, 10(1), 121-136. <https://doi.org/10.46568/pjgs.v10i1.232>
- Eggen, P., & Kauchack, D. (2012). Strategi dan Model Pembelajaran: Mengajar Konten dan Keterampilan Berpikir (edisi keenam). Jakarta: Indeks.
- Emzir. (2012). Metodologi Penelitian Pendidikan: Kuantitatif & Kualitatif. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Gerot, L. & Wignell, P. (1995). Making Sense of Functional Grammar. Australia: Antipodean Educational Enterprises (AEE).
- Gronlund, N. F. (1985). Measurement and Evaluation in Teaching. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Harsiati, T., Trianto, A., & Kosasih, E. (2017). Bahasa Indonesia. Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Ifeoma, E. F. (2022). The Role of Evaluation in Teaching and Learning Process in Education. *International Journal of Advanced Academic and Educational Research*, 13(5), 120-129. <https://arcnjournals.org/images/2726145223713511.pdf>
- Karunasree, K., & Francis, S. (2020). Developing Writing Skills of ESL Learners Using Task Based Language Teaching. *Journal of Critical Reviews*, 7(6), 6-8. <https://doi.org/10.31838/jcr.07.06.02>
- Klimova, B. F. (2014). Approaches to the Teaching of Writing Skills. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 112, 147-151. <https://cyberleninka.org/article/n/425202.pdf>
- Lahir, S., Ma'ruf, M. H., & Tho'in, M. (2017). Peningkatan Prestasi Belajar Melalui Model Pembelajaran yang Tepat pada Sekolah Dasar sampai Perguruan Tinggi. *Edunomika*, 1(1), 1-8. <http://dx.doi.org/10.29040/jje.v1i01.194>
- Lan, Y. F., Hung, C. L., & Hsu, H. J. (2011). Effect of Guided Writing Strategies on Students' Writing Attitudes Based on Media Richness Theory. *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 10(4) 149-152. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ946620>
- Li, K. L., & Razali, A. B. (2019). Idea Sharing: Process-Based Approach to Writing in Malaysian English Education. *PASAA*, 58, 317-339. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1227023>
- Magdalena, I., Fauzi, H. N., & Putri, R. (2020). Pentingnya Evaluasi dalam Pembelajaran dan Akibat Memanipulasinya. *Bintang: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Sains*, 2(2), 244-257.

- <https://ejournal.stitpn.ac.id/index.php/bintang/article/view/986>
Mahsun. (2014). *Teks dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Mohammad, T. & Hazarika, Z. (2016). Difficulties of Learning EFL in KSA: Writing Skills in Context. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 6(3), 105-117. <https://ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/ijel/article/view/60143>
- Pringgawidagda, S. (2002). *Strategi Penguasaan Berbahasa*. Yogyakarta: Adicita Karya.
- Rusman. (2017). *Belajar dan Pembelajaran Berorientasi Standar Proses Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Sudiati & Nurhidayah. (2017). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Membaca Pemahaman Berdasarkan Strategi PLAN untuk Siswa Kelas VII. *Litera*, 16(1), 114-128.
<https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/litera/article/view/14255>
- Trianto. (2011). *Model Pembelajaran Terpadu*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Wahyudi, B. S., Hariyadi, S., & Hariani, S. A. (2014). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Berbasis Model Problem Based Learning pada Pokok Bahasan Pencemaran Lingkungan untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas X SMA Negeri Grujungan Bondowoso. *Pancaran*, 3(3), 83-92.
<https://jurnal.unej.ac.id/index.php/pancaran/article/view/765>
- Westcott, L., Whitcombe, S. W., & Matheson, R. (2010). *Problem Based Learning in Health and Social Care*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing.