



Embracing Cooperative Learning for Critical Thinking and Enhanced Learning Outcomes

Bambang Bagus Harianto
Politeknik Penerbangan Surabaya

Corresponding Author: Bambang Bagus Harianto Bambangfarzardy@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Learning, Critical Thinking, Cooperative Learning

Received : 03 April

Revised : 23 April

Accepted: 24 May

©2024 Harianto: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

This study aims to investigate the effectiveness of the Cooperative Learning approach in improving students' critical thinking and learning outcomes. Critical thinking is a core skill required for effective learning, yet many students struggle to develop this ability. The Cooperative Learning approach has been recognised as effective in improving engagement, collaboration and understanding of concepts in learning. However, research specifically exploring the impact of the Cooperative Learning approach on critical thinking and learning outcomes is limited. This research used a qualitative desk study approach to investigate the role of Cooperative Learning in improving critical thinking and learning outcomes. An in-depth literature review was conducted to gather evidence from various previous studies relevant to this topic. The results showed that the Cooperative Learning approach has a positive impact in improving students' critical thinking. Through collaboration between students, group discussions, and task-based learning experiences, students can significantly develop their critical thinking skills. In addition, the improvement of critical thinking also contributes to the improvement of overall learning outcomes. In conclusion, the Cooperative Learning approach can be an effective strategy in improving students' critical thinking and learning outcomes. The implications of this study highlight the importance of strengthening the Cooperative Learning approach in the context of learning in educational institutions.

INTRODUCTION

Education is a pivotal cornerstone in shaping competent individuals and a dynamic society. However, throughout the educational process, we often encounter significant challenges, one of which is the lack of critical thinking skills development among students. Critical thinking is defined as the ability to analyze, evaluate, and synthesize information critically, which is the essence of effective learning (Nur, 2023)). There is, however, considerable concern that students frequently fail to develop these skills adequately, leading to weaknesses in deep understanding and the ability to address complex real-life challenges.

The importance of critical thinking in education cannot be underestimated. This skill not only aids students in achieving high academic performance but also equips them with the necessary tools to succeed in various aspects of life (Pambudi et al., 2022). Students with strong critical thinking skills can understand problems comprehensively, evaluate arguments objectively, and generate innovative solutions. Therefore, enhancing critical thinking skills is seen as a crucial step in improving the overall quality of education (Dimas Ghimby, 2023).

Cooperative Learning appears to be a promising strategy for enhancing critical thinking abilities and learning outcomes. This methodology emphasizes collaboration and student engagement in achieving educational goals. Students benefit from learning together, in addition to direct instruction from teachers, as they collaborate to learn (Brockett & Hiemstra, 2020). They can exchange ideas, refine their conceptual understanding, and develop essential social skills needed for daily life. Cooperative Learning was developed based on the idea that group interactions can enhance understanding of the subject matter and broaden perspectives. As students work together to achieve common goals, they gain valuable skills in listening to others, considering various viewpoints, and collaborating as a team. This approach is not just about knowledge acquisition but also the development of social skills and critical thinking abilities – two vital components in an ever-changing world (Exley et al., n.d.).

The implementation of Cooperative Learning aims to create an inclusive learning environment where every student feels heard and respected (Taufik, 2020). As a result, it becomes easier to foster a supportive learning environment where students are motivated to fully engage with the curriculum. Consequently, Cooperative Learning contributes not only to students' academic achievements but also to their development as resilient and responsible individuals. Despite its many advantages, Cooperative Learning can be challenging to practice. Effective collaboration requires well-organized classrooms, carefully selected groups, and clear instructions from teachers (Taufik, 2020). Ensuring every student remains actively engaged in the learning process and facilitating meaningful group discussions can also present difficulties.

Considering these advantages and challenges, this study seeks to explore further how Cooperative Learning can enhance students' critical thinking and learning outcomes (Lestariningsih et al., 2021). It is hoped that the findings of this research will provide valuable insights for educators to create more inclusive and effective learning programs.

THEORETICAL REVIEW

Cooperative Learning and Critical Thinking

Cooperative learning (CL) has been extensively studied for its potential to enhance critical thinking skills among students. Critical thinking, which involves the ability to analyze, evaluate, and synthesize information, is a crucial competency in educational settings. Numerous studies have demonstrated that cooperative learning facilitates critical thinking by engaging students in interactive and collaborative activities. According to Johnson and Johnson (2009), CL environments promote deeper understanding through peer discussions and mutual questioning, which are essential for developing critical thinking. Similarly, a study by Gillies (2016) found that cooperative learning groups outperform traditional learning setups in fostering critical thinking skills due to the rich dialogue and diverse perspectives offered in group settings (Gillies, 2016).

Impact of Cooperative Learning on Learning Outcomes

Cooperative learning is not only beneficial for developing critical thinking but also for improving overall learning outcomes. Research indicates that students involved in CL strategies tend to achieve higher academic performance compared to those in traditional learning environments. For instance, Slavin (2014) highlighted that cooperative learning enhances students' academic achievements by promoting engagement and motivation through collaborative efforts. The findings from various meta-analyses, including those by Kyndt et al. (2013), support this assertion, showing significant improvements in student performance across diverse educational contexts when cooperative learning techniques are applied (Slavin, 2014).

Effective Models of Cooperative Learning

Several models of cooperative learning have been identified as particularly effective in enhancing critical thinking and learning outcomes. The Jigsaw method, for example, assigns each student a unique piece of the topic, making them responsible for teaching their piece to their group members. This model not only ensures that all students participate actively but also fosters a deep understanding of the subject matter as students rely on each other to learn. Research by Aronson and Patnoe (2011) supports the efficacy of the Jigsaw method in promoting higher academic achievement and improved critical thinking skills (Aronson & Patnoe, 2011).

Challenges and Solutions in Implementing Cooperative Learning

While cooperative learning has clear benefits, its implementation can present several challenges. Classroom management, diverse student abilities, and resistance to group work are common issues. According to Johnson and Johnson (2009), successful implementation requires careful planning and structured group activities. Teachers need to be trained in CL techniques and classroom management strategies to facilitate effective group work. Additionally, differentiating tasks to cater to various skill levels within the group can help in managing diverse abilities (Johnson & Johnson, 2009).

METHODOLOGY

Based on the understanding of the importance of enhancing students' critical thinking skills and educational goals, as well as the necessity to investigate the potential use of the Cooperative Learning approach as a solution in educational settings, the methodology of this research focuses on topic selection. Using a qualitative literature review approach, this study examines various sources of information, including books, research reports, and articles from scientific journals related to the research topic (Creswell & Clark, 2011). Findings on how Cooperative Learning affects learning outcomes and critical thinking are extracted from the research process through the identification, selection, and content analysis of the chosen sources.

By synthesizing the literature review, carefully interpreting it to provide a comprehensive understanding of the research topic, and identifying patterns, themes, and trends from the data during the qualitative analysis process, this study aims to uncover valuable insights (Pak & Eltiti, 2023). The methodical review and interpretation of the selected literature help to offer an in-depth perspective on the topic under investigation (Patton, 2002).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Critical Thinking in the Context of Learning

Critical thinking in the context of learning encompasses students' ability to dissect, evaluate, and synthesize information critically while engaging in the learning process (Hillman, 2003). This involves not only identifying strong and weak arguments but also questioning assumptions, evaluating evidence, and formulating rational conclusions. In the classroom, critical thinking becomes an essential skill that enables students to develop a deep understanding of the subject matter, tackle complex problems, and make informed decisions. Critical thinking skills in learning demand more than just absorbing information; they involve the ability to analyze and interpret received information and relate it to prior knowledge. Students who excel in critical thinking tend to be more adept at identifying logical fallacies, recognizing cognitive biases, and assessing the accuracy of information.

In the context of learning, critical thinking also involves the ability to solve both simple and complex problems in a systematic and reflective manner (Predanocyová & Jonášková, n.d.). Students with strong critical thinking skills can identify problems, gather relevant information, develop problem-solving strategies, and evaluate the effectiveness of proposed solutions. The importance of critical thinking in learning extends beyond academic aspects; it also impacts students' success in their personal and professional lives (Lin et al., 2020). The ability to critically evaluate information, make informed decisions, and face challenges independently are highly valued skills in various career fields and daily life (Pambudi et al., 2022). Therefore, teaching critical thinking is not only relevant in the classroom but also in equipping students with the necessary skills to succeed in a continuously evolving world.

In practice, developing critical thinking skills in the learning context requires a holistic and integrated approach. This involves creating a stimulating

learning environment, encouraging open dialogue, and providing appropriate challenges to enhance students' critical thinking abilities (Musthafa & Gustine, 2015). Teachers play a crucial role in supporting the development of these skills by providing guidance, offering constructive feedback, and designing learning activities that promote reflection and critical discussion. However, challenges arise in developing critical thinking skills. Often, students face difficulties in understanding the complexity of issues, managing abundant information, and overcoming personal biases. Therefore, teaching approaches designed to stimulate critical thinking must consider variations in students' learning styles, provide appropriate support, and encourage deep reflection.

Effective Cooperative Learning Models

Effective Cooperative Learning models are essential in creating a collaborative and inclusive learning environment (Dimas Ghimby, 2023). These models not only promote knowledge acquisition but also emphasize the development of social skills and critical thinking abilities necessary in an ever-changing world. Here are some key models included in Cooperative Learning:

First, forming small teams where students work together to achieve specific learning objectives. Through structured discussions and shared responsibilities, this model facilitates the exchange of ideas and mutual support among students, laying the foundation for effective Cooperative Learning.

Second, the Jigsaw model stands out as an approach that emphasizes individual responsibility and team interdependence (Damayanti, 2021). In this model, learning material is divided into small segments, which different group members then teach to other students in different groups. This approach not only enhances concept understanding through collaboration but also enriches the learning experience by promoting the diversity of ideas and perspectives (Widia Sari et al., 2019).

Third, the STAD (Student Teams Achievement Divisions) model provides opportunities for students to participate in team-based learning and practice. In this model, each team member is responsible for ensuring that all team members understand the material, encouraging knowledge exchange and effective teamwork.

Fourth, the TGT (Teams-Games-Tournaments) model creates intrinsic motivation through healthy competition among small teams in quiz games or other challenges, while promoting cooperation and active participation in learning (Lestari et al., 2023).

Fifth, the Think-Pair-Share model offers students the chance to process information individually, discuss it with a partner, and then share their thoughts with the group or class. This approach not only builds interpersonal communication skills but also encourages self-reflection and critical thinking.

Sixth, Reciprocal Teaching encourages students to teach each other by guiding, asking questions, clarifying, and responding to each other's understanding. In this way, students become not just recipients but also creators of knowledge, enriching their learning experience (Tahseen Akbar & Dr. Mumtaz Akhtar, 2021).

Educators can maximize the implementation of Cooperative Learning models, resulting in an inclusive learning environment that promotes healthy social interaction among students (Kumbaraningtyas et al., 2019). By facilitating collaboration, idea-sharing, and mutual support, these models create meaningful learning experiences and provide a strong foundation for the holistic development of students (Orhan Göksün & Gürsoy, 2019).

The Role of Teachers in Supporting Cooperative Learning

Teachers play a crucial role in introducing new and effective teaching methods, such as Cooperative Learning, in the evolving field of education. In this method, the teacher acts as a learning facilitator, vital in fostering an inclusive and cooperative learning environment within the classroom. When teachers support Cooperative Learning, they serve as leaders who help students develop critical thinking, social skills, and teamwork abilities, in addition to being information providers. Understanding the significant role teachers play in supporting this approach allows us to further explore how they can influence and shape students' learning experiences (Faisal Mustofa et al., 2018). Here are some roles teachers have in supporting Cooperative Learning:

Firstly, teachers act as learning facilitators responsible for designing, managing, and evaluating learning activities that promote student collaboration. They must select and design group tasks relevant to the curriculum and facilitate discussions that stimulate critical thinking and reflection. Additionally, teachers serve as role models for students by demonstrating the principles of cooperation and active engagement in learning. By showing a positive attitude towards group work and mutual support, teachers help to cultivate a collaborative classroom culture.

Secondly, teachers also function as guides and motivators for students in Cooperative Learning (Mutiarra et al., 2023). They provide support and guidance to students in overcoming challenges, resolving conflicts, and achieving their learning goals. Teachers motivate students to actively participate in the learning process by providing constructive feedback and recognizing their efforts and achievements. By offering appropriate support, teachers enhance student engagement and create a stimulating and supportive learning environment.

Thirdly, teachers serve as fair and objective evaluators in assessing student achievements in Cooperative Learning. They use various assessment tools, such as group assignments, collaborative projects, and self-reflections, to gather data on student engagement and performance. Teachers also provide constructive feedback on student performance and offer direction on improving their collaborative and academic skills. Through fair and transparent evaluations, teachers help students understand their progress and provide additional motivation to strive for better learning outcomes.

Lastly, teachers act as liaisons between students, parents, and school administration in supporting Cooperative Learning. They regularly communicate with parents about student progress and provide information on the learning strategies implemented in the classroom. Furthermore, teachers collaborate with colleagues and school staff to share best practices, resources, and experiences in implementing Cooperative Learning. This collaboration ensures that the approach

is effectively integrated into the broader educational framework and supports a cohesive learning community (Taufik, 2020).

By embracing these roles, teachers can maximize the benefits of Cooperative Learning, fostering an inclusive environment that promotes healthy social interaction among students. Through facilitating cooperation, idea-sharing, and mutual support, teachers not only create meaningful learning experiences but also lay a strong foundation for the holistic development of students.

The Impact of Cooperative Learning on Critical Thinking and Learning Outcomes

Cooperative Learning significantly influences students' learning outcomes and their ability to think critically by involving them in collaborative activities, discussions, and idea-sharing. This method naturally fosters the development of critical thinking skills. Through group discussions and collaborative problem-solving, students enhance their analytical, evaluative, and synthetic abilities (Cahyono et al., 2019). They learn to identify compelling arguments, consider situations from multiple perspectives, and make well-supported decisions. This process deepens their understanding of the subject matter and refines their cognitive skills (Tirre, 2017). The positive impacts of Cooperative Learning on student learning outcomes include:

1. **Encouraging Active Engagement and Collaboration:** Cooperative Learning makes learning more meaningful and relevant by fostering active engagement and collaboration among students. When students feel more involved in the learning process, they become more motivated to learn effectively. In an environment that supports cooperation and positive interdependence, students gain confidence to take risks and explore new ideas. As a result, they tend to achieve higher academic success and better retain the knowledge they acquire.
2. **Promoting Problem-Solving and Critical Thinking:** Cooperative Learning encourages problem-based learning and critical thinking (Kumbaraningtyas et al., 2019). In collaborative learning settings, students are faced with complex challenges that they must solve together. This helps them develop critical thinking skills, such as analyzing problems, formulating hypotheses, and making informed decisions. Students also learn to think creatively and flexibly when searching for solutions to the problems they encounter, which are crucial skills for facing real-world challenges.
3. **Strengthening Social and Communication Skills:** Cooperative Learning enhances students' social and communication skills, which are essential for critical thinking and effective learning outcomes (Dimas Ghimby, 2023). Through structured interactions within groups, students learn to listen empathetically, articulate their ideas clearly, and collaborate with others to achieve common goals. This builds positive relationships with peers, improves teamwork skills, and develops sensitivity to others' needs and perspectives.

By fostering active engagement, collaboration, and reflection in the learning process, Cooperative Learning greatly enhances students' learning outcomes and critical thinking abilities. This approach helps students develop the cognitive, social, and communication skills necessary for success in school and life. Consequently, students become more competent, independent, and knowledgeable, evolving into more effective learners(Hue, 2021).

Challenges and Strategies in Implementing Cooperative Learning

Implementing Cooperative Learning in the classroom is not an easy task, as it often encounters several challenges that need to be addressed to ensure smooth learning. One of the main challenges is students' resistance or lack of understanding of the collaborative concept. Some students may be more accustomed to teacher-centered or individual learning, requiring extra time and effort to adapt to group cooperation(Tapani & Salonen, 2019). Additionally, classroom management issues can hinder the implementation of Cooperative Learning(Lestari et al., 2023). Managing groups, distributing roles, and supervising group work are critical aspects that must be handled to avoid chaos or imbalances in learning. Teachers need to develop effective classroom management strategies, such as providing clear rules, setting realistic expectations, and offering appropriate support to students.

The varying skill levels and interests among students within groups can also pose challenges in implementing Cooperative Learning. More proficient or active students might dominate the group, while less proficient or less confident students may feel marginalized (Susilowati et al., 2021). Thus, it is crucial for teachers to pay attention to group composition and provide additional support to students who need it. This can be achieved by differentiating tasks or offering individual guidance to students in need. Another challenge is the lack of time and resources available, which may become obstacles in implementing Cooperative Learning(Widia Sari et al., 2019). Collaborative learning often requires more time than traditional learning as it involves intensive discussions, negotiations, and group work. Therefore, teachers need to plan carefully and allocate sufficient time for each learning activity. Efficient and creative use of available resources can also help overcome these constraints. Moreover, the lack of training and support for teachers in implementing Cooperative Learning can be a hurdle. Teachers need to understand the principles and strategies underlying collaborative learning and have the skills to manage the classroom effectively in this context(Ocak & Yamaç, 2013). Therefore, support from schools or educational institutions in providing training, resources, and mentoring for teachers can be very helpful in overcoming this challenge.

Implementing Cooperative Learning strategies in teaching requires a planned and sustained approach to ensure its effectiveness. Some strategies that can be used include:

1. **Designing Learning Activities That Foster Cooperation and Interaction:** Teachers can create group activities that encourage active student participation, such as group discussions, cooperative projects, and group-based tasks. Engaging in such activities facilitates peer learning and helps

students develop valuable life skills such as communication, cooperation, and social skills.

2. **Ensuring Balanced and Diverse Group Composition:** To maximize student participation in Cooperative Learning, teachers should consider factors such as skill levels, interests, and learning styles when forming groups (Sirait, 2019). This way, students can support and learn from each other while appreciating diverse opinions and perspectives.
3. **Establishing Norms That Support Cooperation and Mutual Respect:** Teachers should communicate clear expectations and rules about how students should interact and collaborate in Cooperative Learning. This helps create a safe and supportive environment where students feel comfortable sharing ideas, asking questions, and providing feedback to one another (Mahvelati, 2021).
4. **Providing Appropriate Guidance and Support:** Teachers need to offer clear directions on roles and responsibilities within groups and guide students in completing tasks or resolving conflicts that may arise. By providing adequate support, teachers ensure that all students can participate actively and feel engaged in learning (Muñoz et al., 2022).
5. **Continuous Reflection and Feedback:** Teachers should give students opportunities to reflect on their learning experiences, identify their strengths and weaknesses, and plan for future improvements (Putu Widyanto et al., 2022). Feedback from teachers helps students understand areas that need improvement and provides necessary guidance for further development.
6. **Collaborating With Stakeholders:** Involving teachers, students, parents, and school administration in the learning process helps build strong support and a supportive environment for Cooperative Learning. This collaboration creates opportunities to share knowledge, experiences, and resources, reinforcing a collective commitment to students' success in Cooperative Learning (Taufik, 2020).

By effectively implementing these strategies, teachers can create a collaborative, inclusive, and stimulating learning environment that enables students to reach their full potential.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Implementing Cooperative Learning in education is a crucial step towards enhancing social interaction, student engagement, and their learning outcomes. Understanding the related challenges and strategies, along with the pivotal role of teachers in supporting this process, it can be concluded that Cooperative Learning holds significant potential for improving classroom learning. To maximize its benefits, it's essential for teachers to continuously develop skills in designing, implementing, and evaluating Cooperative Learning, while considering the unique needs and characteristics of each class and student. Sustained support from the school, adequate training for teachers, and collaboration among all education stakeholders will be key to addressing challenges and achieving success in

implementing Cooperative Learning in the learning environment (Silber et al., 2012).

FURTHER STUDY

In writing this article the researcher realizes that there are still many shortcomings in terms of language, writing, and form of presentation considering the limited knowledge and abilities of the researchers themselves. Therefore, for the perfection of the article, the researcher expects constructive criticism and suggestions from various parties.

REFERENCES

- Brockett, R. G., & Hiemstra, R. (2020). *Self-direction in adult learning: Perspectives on theory, research, and practice*. Routledge.
- Cahyono, B., Kartono, Waluyo, B., & Mulyono. (2019). Analysis critical thinking skills in solving problems algebra in terms of cognitive style and gender. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1321(2). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1321/2/022115>
- Creswell, J. W., & Clark, V. L. P. (2011). Choosing a mixed methods design. In *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research* (pp. 53–106). Sage Publications, Inc.
- Damayanti, D. (2021). Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Mengoperasikan Peralatan Pengolahan Hasil Pertanian Dengan Metode Cooperative Learning Tipe Jigsaw. *Jurnal Educatio FKIP UNMA*, 7(2), 541–545. <https://doi.org/10.31949/educatio.v7i2.1089>
- Dimas Ghimby, A. B. (2023). *SOLIDARITY: Journal of social Studies The Effect Of Self-Regulated Learning On Critical Thinking Skills And Learning Outcomes*. <http://solidarity.iain-jember.ac.id>
- Exley, B., Hoyte, F., & Hawken, S. (n.d.). *Peer Reviewed Paper Literacy Learning: the Middle Years Exploring the three dimensions of teacher assessment literacies through a school-university laboratory*.
- Faisal Mustofa, R., Pendidikan Biologi, J., & Siliwangi, U. (2018). Pengaruh Pembelajaran Learning Cycle 5e Terhadap Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Dan Hasil Belajar. In *Bioedusiana* (Vol. 3, Issue 2). <http://jurnal.unsil.ac.id/index.php/bioed/index>
- Hillman, W. (2003). Learning How to Learn : Problem Based Learning. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 28(2). <https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2003v28n2.1>
- Hue, J.-P. (2021). A Study of the Effectiveness of PBL and MAKER Classes Based on Flipped Learning. *Journal of Problem-Based Learning*, 8(2), 53–61. <https://doi.org/10.24313/jpbl.2021.00038>
- Kumbaraningtyas, A., Relmasira, S. C., Tyas, A., Hardini, A., Info, J., & Glasser, J. P. (2019). *Penerapan Model Cooperative Learning Tipe Group Investigation Untuk Meningkatkan Berpikir Kritis Dan Hasil Belajar Siswa*. <https://doi.org/10.32529/glasser.v%vi%i.215>
- Lestari, D., Vahlia, I., Anggraeni, D., Program,), Pendidikan, S., Sekolah Dasar, G., Terbuka, U., Bhayangkara, U., & Raya, J. (2023). Penerapan Model Cooperative Learning TGT Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Kelas IV SD Mata Pelajaran IPS Materi Sumber Daya Alam. *ELEMENTARY JOURNAL*, 6(1).
- Lestariningsih, D., Nurlaela, L., Mariono, A., & Harianto, G. P. (2021). The Effect of the Problem-Based Learning Model on Learning Outcomes in the Course of Learning

- Strategy at Stttaa Pacet Mojokerto. *Ijicc.Net*, 15(6).
https://www.ijicc.net/images/Vol_15/Iss_6/15668_Lestariningsih_2021_E1_R.pdf
- Lin, X. Q., Chen, Y. C., Liu, C. H., & Li, Y. Q. (2020). Service quality management from social capital, environmental uncertainty, and competitive intensity perspectives. *Social Behavior and Personality*, 48(5).
<https://doi.org/10.2224/sbp.9178>
- Mahvelati, E. H. (2021). Learners' perceptions and performance under peer versus teacher corrective feedback conditions. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 70.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2021.100995>
- Muñoz, J. L. R., Ojeda, F. M., Jurado, D. L. A., Peña, P. F. P., Carranza, C. P. M., Berríos, H. Q., Molina, S. U., Farfan, A. R. M., Arias-González, J. L., & Vasquez-Pauca, M. J. (2022). Systematic Review of Adaptive Learning Technology for Learning in Higher Education. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 2022(98), 221–233.
<https://doi.org/10.14689/ejer.2022.98.014>
- Musthafa, A. P., & Gustine, B. (2015). Using cooperative learning in teaching critical thinking in reading. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 4(1), 1–14.
<https://journal.uniku.ac.id/index.php/ERJEE>
- Mutiara, R., Fitria Hermiati, N., Kerja Non Fisik, L., Organisasi, K., Kerja, K., & Pegawai, K. (2023). *Pengaruh Lingkungan Kerja Non Fisik dan Komitmen Organisasi terhadap Kinerja Pegawai dengan Kepuasan Kerja sebagai Variabel Intervening* Kata kunci (Vol. 6, Issue 7). <http://iip.stkipyapisdompu.ac.id>
- Nur, S. (2023). Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis dan Hasil Belajar Kognitif Mahasiswa Pendidikan Biologi. *SAINTIFIK*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.31605/saintifik.v9i1.408>
- Ocak, G., & Yamaç, A. (2013). Examination of the relationships between fifth graders' self-regulated learning strategies, motivational beliefs, attitudes, and achievement. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, 13(1), 380–387.
- Orhan Gökşün, D., & Gürsoy, G. (2019). Comparing success and engagement in gamified learning experiences via Kahoot and Quizizz. *Computers and Education*, 135, 15–29. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2019.02.015>
- Pak1, J. H., & Eltiti2, S. (2023). Integrating Theology in Teaching Quantitative and Qualitative Research in Psychology. *Journal of Psychology and Christianity Differences Be-2023*, 42(1), 15–28.
- Pambudi, A., Nyoto, A., Teknik Mesin, J., Teknik, F., & Negeri Malang, U. (2022). *Perbedaan Berfikir Kritis Dan Hasil Belajar Antara Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Think Talk Write Dan Student Team Achievement Division Siswa Kelas Xi Tkro Smkn 6 Malang*. 6(2), 9–18. <http://journal2.um.ac.id/index.php/jto>
- Predanociová, A. L., & Jonášková, A. G. (n.d.). *Section Education And Educational Research Critical Thinking As Educational Challenge*.
- Putu Widyanto, I., Vienlentina, R., & Artikel Abstrak, I. (2022). *Peningkatan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis dan Hasil Belajar Peserta Didik menggunakan Student Centered Learning*. <http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jptpp/>
- Silber, G. K., Vanderlaan, A. S. M., Tejedor Arceredillo, A., Johnson, L., Taggart, C. T., Brown, M. W., Bettridge, S., & Sagarminaga, R. (2012). The role of the International Maritime Organization in reducing vessel threat to whales: Process, options, action and effectiveness. *Marine Policy*, 36(6), 1221–1233.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2012.03.008>

- Sirait, E. D. (2019). Pengaruh Gaya Dan Kebiasaan Belajar Terhadap Kemampuan Berfikir Kritis Matematika. *SAP (Susunan Artikel Pendidikan)*, 4(1).
- Susilowati, W., Harsan, T., & Hadiprasetyo, K. (2021). *Peningkatan Kemampuan Berfikir Kritis Dan Hasil Belajar Ips Melalui Media Powerpoint Interaktif*.
- Tahseen Akbar, & Dr. Mumtaz Akhtar. (2021). Effect of Cooperative Learning Strategies on Students' Critical Thinking Skills; Interpretation and Analysis at Higher Secondary Level. *Sjesr*, 4(2), 386–394. [https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol4-iss2-2021\(386-394\)](https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol4-iss2-2021(386-394))
- Tapani, A., & Salonen, A. O. (2019). Identifying teachers' competencies in Finnish vocational education. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 6(3), 243–260. <https://doi.org/10.13152/IJRVET.6.3.3>
- Taufik. (2020). Pengaruh Cooperative Learning (TPS) Dan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Siswa. In *Jurnal Pendas Mahakam* (Vol. 5, Issue 2). Desember.
- Tirre, W. (2017). Conscientiousness provides high school students an advantage in achieving good grades incrementally to general cognitive ability. In *From: North American Journal of Psychology* (Vol. 19, Issue 2). <http://www.projecttalent.org/>
- Vermunt, J. D. (1998). The regulation of constructive learning processes. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 68(2), 149–171. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8279.1998.tb01281.x>
- Widia Sari, A., Relmasira, S. C., & Tyas Asri Hardini, A. (2019). (Avita Widia Sari) Melalui Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Learning Tipe Jigsaw. *Journal of Education Action Research*, 3(2), 72–79. <https://ejournal.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/JEAR/index>