

Marketing Communications' Message Strategies of TikTok Shop Indonesia and Shopee Indonesia Through Social Media Instagram

Rahma Maulinda Dwinari^{1*}, Pawito², Andre Noevi Rahmanto³
Universitas Sebelas Maret

Corresponding Author: Rahma Maulinda Dwinari
rahma_maulinda18@student.uns.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: TikTok Shop Indonesia, Shopee Indonesia, Instagram, Message Strategy, Marketing Communication

Received : 1 November

Revised : 19 November

Accepted: 19 December

©2023 Dwinari, Pawito, Rahmanto:

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Atribusi 4.0 Internasional](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

TikTok Shop and Shopee are two e-commerce sites that using Instagram as a marketing communication medium. This study aims to discover the message strategy's from the Instagram's contents of @TikTokShop_Indonesia and @Shopee_ID in welcoming the month of Ramadan in 2023. The message strategy theory is the reference in this study. This study uses a qualitative approach with content analysis methods. The study results show that @TikTokShop_Indonesia content focus on transformational messages, informational messages become the focus afterward, and interactional messages still need to achieve. TikTok Shop Indonesia is more focused on touching the emotional motivation of its consumers with the hope that consumer involvement will increase. Instead, @Shopee_ID puts interactional messages and transformational messages above informational messages

INTRODUCTION

Technology advances have had a very significant impact on human life. One part is also experiencing changes in people's shopping patterns, which can now be quickly done only through smartphones. Recently, people have been introduced to a new model of online shopping platforms, namely social commerce, which is social media that adopts the work system of e-commerce. According to Kim & Park (2013), social commerce is an e-commerce platform that utilizes social interaction and the contribution of social media users in online shopping. Online shopping is people's choice because online shopping has a variety of benefits, such as saving time, effort, and money (Latif and Ishak., 2022). Several important factors in online shopping are online services and product quality, which can be an incentive to build relationships with consumers (Moon et al., 2021).

Quoted from KumparanTECH (2022), based on a survey by Populix in July-August 2022, 86% of respondents admitted that they had made shopping transactions through social commerce. TikTok Shop leads as the most used social commerce with 45%, followed by WhatsApp (21%), Facebook Shop (10%), and Instagram Shop (10%). The TikTok Shop is a feature included in the TikTok application (Tusanputri and Amron, 2021). TikTok Shop offers a shopping experience from product selection through the storefront to the finalization stage in just one application.

Like the TikTok Shop, Shopee has now developed live streaming features, Shopee videos, and the Shopee Affiliate Program. Quoted from Lestarini (2023), ahead of Ramadan, this online shopping application occupies the first position as The Brand Use Most Often (BUMO), The Most Remembered Brand (top of mind), Market Share of Number of Transactions (share of orders), and Market Share of Transaction Value (according to a survey conducted by Snapcart entitled "Trends of Online Shopping Behavior Welcome Ramadan 2023"). The existence of a marketplace and all its benefits has an essential function for consumers in online buying and selling. Shopee is considered to fulfill aspects of effectiveness and efficiency because it provides buying and selling transactions only via smartphones (Amelia & Sudrartono, 2023).

The momentum of Ramadan is the most eagerly awaited by Muslims worldwide. As in countries with a predominantly Muslim population, Ramadan is a special moment in Indonesia. During Ramadan, many shops or e-commerce offer products to meet various needs (Rahayu et al., 2023). Various e-commerce platforms compete with each other to attract consumer interest through marketing communication strategies, including TikTok Shop Indonesia and Shopee Indonesia. TikTok Shop, the most widely used social commerce in Indonesia, and Shopee, the most frequently used marketplace in Indonesia, certainly have their strategy to ensure transactions occur. Ramadan is closely related to preparations for Eid al-Fitr, where the custom of Muslims in Indonesia at that moment is to decorate their houses and buy new clothes to prepare themselves to welcome guests who are about to come on Eid al-Fitr (Habriyanto, 2019).

As quoted from Hootsuite's Digital Report (2023), in the first quarter of 2023, Instagram managed to rank as the second most used social media in Indonesia after WhatsApp. As the most popular social media today, it's no wonder that Instagram can reach a wider audience than other types of social media. Other users can interact with the content by liking, sharing, or leaving comments. Currently, Instagram is incredibly gaining popularity among teenagers to adults, and most of them check their Instagram accounts at least once daily (Faelens et al., 2021).

This research was carried out to know the characteristics of message strategies in marketing communications carried out by TikTok Shop Indonesia and Shopee Indonesia through Instagram in February-April 2023, coinciding with the momentum of welcoming Ramadan 2023. This research uses qualitative content analysis techniques. Message strategy theory is used to interpret messages in each upload. Before that, the content uploads were first grouped into four content categories. Every uploaded content can impact online engagement, as seen from the number of likes and comments (Outer et al., 2015). Customer engagement can be created when followers of social media accounts or consumers have an emotional bond in rational exchange activities with the company (Hanggraito et al., 2022).

Pandrianto & Sukendro (2018) are trying to see whether social media marketing content has been produced according to its purpose. The research results show that the content strategy chosen by Pasar Papringan accounts still needs to be more informative and relevant to the audience. Tania & Laksono (2022) conducted research to analyze social media persuasive messages on Somethinc's Instagram account. This study concludes that on Somethinc's Instagram account, the more dominant type of persuasive message is informative messages that align with the main line. Nasution et al. (2023) examine the message strategy applied in zakat campaigns on social media to increase its effectiveness. The research results show that the message strategy plays a role in supporting the campaign's success, informational and transformational messages have a significant effect.

The urgency of conducting this research is to understand how the message strategy in marketing communications is carried out by e-commerce to secure their position amidst the heated competition during Ramadan through Instagram. The results will be a benchmark for medium and small-scale companies and e-commerce players to see how each platform has its characteristics in developing a message strategy closely related to the marketing communications objectives. Aiming to identify the character of the message strategy carried out by Instagram accounts @TikTokShop_Indonesia and @Shopee_ID in the month of Ramadan 2023, as well as interpret the results from the analysis of the findings, this research was conducted.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Marketing Communications

Marketing communication is a form of container or facility owned by a company or a brand to convey information, persuade, and remind consumers, directly or indirectly related to the brand and products or services the company offers (Kotler & Keller, 2012). Marketing communication is an execution tool that determines the success or failure of a product or service that the public can recognize at large. Marketing communication is said to be the spearhead of the company. Marketing communication not only plays a role in maintaining the company's survival but also encourages the company to be able to compete with its competitors (Lestari, 2015).

Kotler (2014) states that two-way communication between companies and consumers is said to be much more effective when compared to conventional or one-way advertising in marketing activities. Chrismardani et al., (2014) mention that marketing is a strategic part of the business process. When executed correctly, communication can be a weapon in do marketing because communication can turn on people's desires or Target audiences to be moved to make a purchase. The function of the communication strategy is summed up in two, both on a large scale and on a small scale, by systematically disseminating informative, persuasive, and instructive communication messages to targets to achieve optimal output (Suka and Lubis, 2019).

Message Strategy Theory

The message strategy theory is the instrument that will be used to analyze messages uploaded by TikTok Shop Indonesia and Shopee Indonesia through Instagram. Message strategy theory by Tafesse & Wien (2018) is used to help analyze the message content of each uploaded content. Messages are divided into three categories, informational, transformational, and interactional messages. Informational message strategies are rationally oriented, informing consumers about how products and services can meet audience needs. Meanwhile, the transformational message strategy emphasizes the symbolic and hedonic attributes of products and services, association experiences, and brand identity with psychological characteristics. This transformational message is closely related to emotional, symbolic, and hedonic. Then lastly, the interactional message strategy allows brands to connect with customers on a personal level through conversations that require brands to engage in active discussions with customers according to the culture of social media interactivity.

A significant finding in this field in its early days, Puto & Wells (1984) developed a typology of message strategies with informational and transformational dimensions. The information message strategy presents factual information about products and services clearly and concretely; message transformation strategies associate brand identity experiences and focus with desired psychological characteristics; and interactional messaging strategies foster ongoing customer interactions (Laskey et al., 1989). Several studies considered the possibility of concurrent brand uploads and attempts to communicate multiple message strategies. Brand uploads support various media types, including text, photos, videos, and website links. Marketers can convey a different message through each medium (Araujo et al., 2015).

In research conducted by Nasution et al., (2023), the results theoretically support the message content dichotomy as in Tafesse & Wien (2018). They suggest that message strategies are divided into informational messages, which are rational and aim to influence cognitively, and transformational messages, which are emotional and seek to influence effectively. However, interactional messages are also critical in social media if the target is the current and next generation.

METHODOLOGY

This study used a qualitative approach with content analysis methods. Content analysis is a directed analysis that intends to give a holistic meaning to the content being studied and focuses on the core purpose that fits the question and the aims and conceptual framework of the research (Mongilo, 2020). Qualitative content analysis enables researchers to understand texts through categorization based on similar meanings into several groups to create a conceptual model or system (Rumata, 2017). Researchers can recognize and interpret explicit messages in qualitative content analysis research, but the implied message of a document under study is recognized and interpreted. This approach systematically analyzes and evaluates text (e.g., documents, verbal communications, messages, and graphics) (Rashkova et al., 2023). Elo & Kyngäs (2008) explained that if the content analysis is inductive, the next step is organizing qualitative data. This process includes open coding, categorizing, and abstraction. Open coding can be done after data is collected. Once the encoding is open, then the list of categories is grouped. The purpose of grouping data is to reduce the number of types by eliminating similar and different ones into broader categories (Dey, 1993). The last step is abstraction, and abstraction means formulating a general description of the research topic that has been categorized (Polit & Beck, 2003).

Primary data for this study were obtained through non-participant observation of the Instagram content of @TikTokShop_Indonesia and @Shopee_ID. The selected content is the type of content that is most often uploaded and has the highest engagement rate or the most popular, based on the number of interactions with audiences (likes and comments) on both accounts (from February 2023 to April 2023). The reason for choosing this period is because it coincides with the atmosphere of welcoming the holy month of Ramadan. The demand for a commodity increases rapidly every month of Ramadan (Fadillatunnisa & Nawawi, 2022). Secondary data for this study were obtained through documents and literature studies. The validity test used in this study is a type of data triangulation.

RESEARCH RESULTS

The social media Instagram, TikTok Shop Indonesia, has around 20,600 followers, with 353 content uploaded. Uploads on the Instagram account of @TikTokShop_Indonesia in the period 1 February-15 April 2023 (2.5 months) were counted and observed, and there was a total of 74 content uploaded during the study period. After going through the selection stage, four content categories emerged: discounts, giveaways, collaborations, and tips and tricks. The content in that category is the most frequently uploaded. The selected content that is analyzed is the content that has the highest engagement in each category during the research period.

Table 1. Four Categories of Uploaded Content on the @TikTokShop_Indonesia

No.	Upload Date	Short Description	Number of Likes and Comments	Category
	March 26, 2023	Schedule of the #InspirasiRamadanTikTokShop collaboration program, which will be delivered via live streaming by several public figures and influencers.	41 Likes and 0 Comments	Collaboration
	March 27, 2023	The TikTok Shop Giveaway program with the main prize is a smartphone and two other awards.	696 Likes and 949 Comments	<i>Giveaways</i>
	March 29, 2023	Tips to keep your body fit in the month of Ramadan	4,528 Likes and 3 Comments	<i>Tips and tricks</i>
	April 4, 2023	Information on '4.4 Puncak Ramadan Promo', which informs you of shopping discount vouchers and free shipping.	41 Likes and 1 Comment	Discounts

Shopee Indonesia's Instagram account (@Shopee_ID) has managed to gain followers of 8.8 million, and the number of uploads has exceeded 16,159 since its appearance in Indonesia in 2015. Similar to the treatment applied to the @TikTokShop_Indonesia account, content from the @Shopee_ID account was calculated and observed during the research period (1 February-15 April 2023), and a total of 632 content uploads were found. Then a selection is made to obtain four content categories: discounts, giveaways, collaborations, and tips and tricks.

Table 2. Four Categories of Uploaded Content on the @Shopee_ID

No.	Upload Date	Short Description	Number of Likes and Comments	Category
1	February 5, 2023	The 'Spill Racun Shopee Viral' program is a collaboration with influencers to provide product recommendations to consumers	2,605 Likes and 108 Comments	Collaboration
2	February 18, 2023	Tips on how to fold a zip hoodie so it's simple and doesn't take up space	6,994 Likes and 128 Comments	Tips and tricks
3	March 29, 2023	The 'Big Ramadan Sale' program with free shipping promo offers, the biggest THR promo, and the main Toyota Agya promo for IDR 1.-	1,740 Likes and 100 Comments	Discounts
4	April 14, 2023	'Giveaway Spesial Bulan Ramadan' with the main prize I Phone 12 worth IDR 12,299,000	39,730 Likes and 29,204 Comments	Giveaways

DISCUSSION

Instagram is one of the digital innovations that recently emerged in the reform era. Even though it was only discovered in 2010, Instagram has become a social media many people access after Facebook. Unlike Facebook, which still prioritizes text, Instagram prioritizes visualization through images, infographics, and videos. Instagram is similar to television because it makes it easy for followers to capture information visually (Prawitasari et al., 2020). TikTok Shop Indonesia and Shopee

TikTok Shop Indonesia (@TikTokShop_Indonesia)

Discount

Discounts significantly create positive feelings for consumers (JE Lee & Chen-Yu, 2018). A discount is a reduction in the purchase price for a specified period. Discount pricing has become a habit for several companies that provide products or services (Nainggolan & Parenduri, 2020). Pribadi and Irawan (1981) (in Hidayat, 2020) convey that promotion is a flow of information that can also be said as a one-way persuasion. Promotion is designed to influence a person or group of people to take an action that results in an exchange of marketing activities. Price is one part of the marketing mix, in which consumers always see it as one of the main components in purchasing considerations. It is undeniable that price significantly influences consumer purchasing decisions (Nur & Arnu, 2021).

According to Puto and Wells (1984), Informational messages contain messages that present genuine product or service information clearly and concretely. This message intends to inform the audience or consumers regarding the characteristics of the services offered by TikTok Shop Indonesia, namely price discounts packaged into various models. TikTok Shop Indonesia uploaded the content '4.4 Puncak Ramadan Promo', which contains information on shopping discount vouchers, free shipping vouchers, gift coupons, and special cashback for new users.

Uploads contain messages that fulfill transformational aspects because these uploads contain brand resonance messages, in which brand resonance is an indicator of transformational messages (Tafesse & Wien, 2018). Brand resonance is focused directly on brand promise and identity. These posts highlight key identity elements, such as brand image, personality, associations, and products (Nasution et al., 2023). TikTok Shop Indonesia increased promotional content and conducted a free shipping program throughout Indonesia with no minimum nominal spending requirements (Pratiwi et al., 2023). Efforts to create a brand image as a free shipping online shopping platform are part of brand resonance activities. In the interactional aspect, the content '4.4 Puncak Ramadan Promo' uploaded by the Instagram account from the TikTok Shop Indonesia does not appear to have a single pinned comment. Followers only provide feedback via likes. Interactional messaging allows brands to connect with consumers personally through conversation (Tafesse & Wien, 2018). So the interactional aspects can not be achieved.

Giveaway

Putri & Susilowati (2017) said that a giveaway is an activity of giving gifts for free carried out by people or companies to anyone with a gift in the form of a product or service that has been promised. Giveaway participants must meet the requirements required by the giveaway giver to be able to participate in the giveaway program being held. Even though there will only be one to three winners, it is not uncommon for uploads related to giveaway programs or activities to get very high enthusiasm from the public.

Almost all users of smartphones are Instagram social media users (Putri & Gartanti, 2021). TikTok Shop Indonesia uploaded the giveaway content on its Instagram account. The first slide contains text in the form of giveaway information with the main prize for the Realme Pro 10 5G smartphone and two other prizes for the second and third winners, namely the Realme Buds T100 and the Realme Phone Holder. One of the conditions that participants must meet is to write a comment on their experience shopping for the cheapest electronic goods at the TikTok Shop with the hashtag #ELECTRONIKTERMURAH. The information in the caption consists of the requirements for participants. They must follow the TikTok Shop Indonesia Instagram account; like and comment, comment on the shopping experience #ELECTRONIKTERMURAH, then tag two other friends;

Giveaway content is closely related to efforts to gain popularity. Online shops often carry out giveaways because it easily attracts the public's attention (Cahyono & Ni'mah, 2021). In addition, giveaway content is often used to maintain good consumer relations. Giveaway content cannot be said to be part of an informational message strategy because it does not contain messages that contain information regarding the products and services of the company. Informational messages inform consumers about how products and services can solve their functional problems (Nasution et al., 2023).

The giveaway content uploaded by @TikTokShop_ID fulfills one of the four indicators of a transformational message, an emotional post. Emotional posts usually use emotionally charged language to evoke an adequate response, such as pleasure, joy, astonishment, and so on (Nasution et al., 2023). Giveaway content can elicit reactions from Instagram audiences. This upload can attract the audience's curiosity, arouse interest in participating, and create a feeling of joy for participants who have won prizes.

The upload of giveaway content on the TikTok Shop Indonesia Instagram account managed to get many comments, so interaction was created. The upload of giveaway content on the Instagram account of TikTok Shop Indonesia managed to collect as many as 878 comments, making it the upload with the highest number of comments throughout the research period on the @TikTokShop_Indonesia Instagram account. Interactional messages indicate activeness in building consumer relationships through social media (Msallati, 2021). Even though it can create such a large amount of interaction or engagement, the content in the form of a giveaway program differs from the content most often uploaded by the TikTok Shop Indonesia Instagram account.

Tafesse & Wien (2018) explained that uploading a customer relation type is a typology suggestion for interactional messages. This post attempts to gather information and feedback about customer needs, expectations, and experiences. These posts seek to deepen the impact of customer relationships by encouraging customer feedback, reviews, and testimonies, among other things. The conditions that the participants of the giveaway activity must meet are to write comments on their #ELECTRONIKTERMURAH shopping experience; this is an effort made by the TikTok Shop to implement the concept of customer relation posts. Fitriyah (2020) defines a giveaway is a trick to increase followers and popularity. With various conditions in the giveaway program, what is to be achieved is increased exposure, reach & engagement.

Collaboration

Collaboration or partnership is a broad term often used to describe a model of cooperative relationship carried out by many parties (Tampanguma et al., 2020). Collaboration to achieve marketing goals is carried out by companies with Key Opinion Leaders, which is an asset of social relations (Jackson et al., 2021). The collaboration aims to achieve common goals by helping each other (Tampanguma et al., 2020).

Through its Instagram social media account, TikTok Shop Indonesia uses e-WOM (electronic Word of Mouth) activities to increase message reach and engagement by appointing several public figures, such as celebrities, celebrities,

and influencers. These public figures act as Key Opinion Leaders or KOLs. Yuanita (2021) described Key Opinion Leaders (KOL) as active figures in social networks. Likes or pursues in sharing ideas with many people or audiences, which have appeal and can influence the minds and behavior of audiences.

The selected KOLs will guide the sales process through the live streaming feature on the TikTok application. KOL has the power to influence the behavior of consumers who are also social media users (Cantika and Kurnia, 2023). There is also information about discounted promos and a complete live-streaming event schedule on the poster. Collaborative content with KOL uploaded by the Instagram social media account TikTok Shop Indonesia contains informational messages because it contains functional and rational information about the services or products offered (Msallati, 2021). The message composition starts from the implementation schedule, KOL, which will later guide sales through live streaming on the TikTok application, to attractive promos that have been displayed.

There are no embedded comments in uploading collaborative content on the Instagram social media account @TikTokShop_Indonesia. So the interactional message still needs to be fulfilled. Interactional messages are constructive for stimulating conversation with customers, while informational messages can quickly spark interest in a product. Therefore, a social media team leader must master designing posts (Tafesse & Wien, 2018).

Marketers must build advertising creatives through transformational message strategies, especially emotional uploads, experiences, and brand resonance (Tafesse & Wien, 2018). At the #InspirasiRamadanTikTokShop event, KOLs provided product recommendations based on their consumer experiences. This further inspires the public to make purchases because they believe that the experiences of KOLs are relevant to them so that they can be used as a reference in buying decisions.

Tips and Tricks

Tips and tricks are one of the content upload ideas through social media. Brands or companies can display content in the form of tips and tricks related to any matter, including information and tips that match the character of the product being sold or the company's image (Saputri & Hanifa, 2021). Instagram account @TikTokShop_Indonesia uploads content as tips to stay fit during Ramadan. The TikTok Shop uses every recommendation point as a means of soft-selling products relevant to the atmosphere being built. Soft selling is a sales technique with a storytelling style, so it doesn't appear as if you are selling a product or service but still aims to offer or persuade (Faizaty and Laili, 2021). The first tip, choosing the right time when exercising, ends by displaying a product portrait of the watch. Second, wear clothes with a suitable material inserted with product recommendations for sportswear. The third tip, ensuring the body is hydrated, is complemented by product recommendations for drinking bottles. Messages are packaged and predictably so the audience can quickly understand the intent of delivering tips as part of a marketing strategy. This recommendation system aims to help users identify products that suit their needs, preferences, and desires (Prasetya, 2017).

Content in the form of tips and tricks uploaded by the Instagram social media account @TikTokShop_Indonesia has met the criteria as an informational message. This type of informational message presents factual and transparent information about a product or service, in which the user engages in a rational thinking process to judge and analyze this type of content. (Msallati, 2021).

This type is identified with the psychological experience connected with users when evaluating social media uploads (Laskey et al., 1989). Uploads of tips and tricks content take on the role of displaying messages in the form of information. Still, implicit uploads of content uploaded by @TikTokShop_ID also touch the audience's emotions. Where the tips given are very close to everyday life. As we already know, Ramadan is an exceptional month and is eagerly awaited by the people of Indonesia.

The final form, interactional message, relational in nature, is actively connecting with consumers through social media (Msallati, 2021). There are only three comments on uploading tips and tricks on the Instagram TikTok Shop, and in the form of reactions only. There is no further interaction between the audience and the TikTok Shop Indonesia team and between the audience and the audience, so the successful upload indicates that an interactional message needs to be fulfilled.

Shopee Indonesia (@Shopee_ID) Discount

Discount is an overall marketing strategy to attract consumers by providing extra value or incentives, thus encouraging consumers to buy the promoted product immediately (Yin & Huang, 2014). Price discounts provide a monetary advantage, an incentive to encourage consumers to buy a product (JE Lee & Chen-Yu, 2018). Discount content uploaded by @Shopee_ID is the second content that dominates uploads during the research period. Discounts can be in the form of discounts, flash sales, vouchers, to free shipping. Uploads selected for analysis are uploads with the highest engagement in the discounted content category.

Puto & Wells (1984) stated that informational messages in advertisements provide brand data that is facts and relevant to consumers. Shopee Indonesia uploaded discounted content titled 'Big Ramadan Sale' through its Instagram account, which contains information on shipping costs and THR bonuses. Apart from that, Shopee also includes a reminder for the audience regarding the peak promo 'Big Ramadan Sale' with the main product Toyota Agya for only IDR 1. Nainggolan & Parenduri (2020) mention that the promotion of price discounts, demonstrations, and special packaging can influence a person's final decision to purchase. So the information contained in the discounted content is very relevant to society's general needs, and Shopee consumers in particular.

If informational messages are rational, transformational messages tend to be emotional (Puto and Wells, 1984). The price of the Toyota Agya car, which is only priced at Rp. 1, proves that rationality has been deliberately abolished. This succeeded in attracting emotions from the audience because many people still want to buy a car but are constrained by needing more money. Many factors influence purchasing decisions through Shopee, including the free shipping

promo (Istiqomah and Marlina, 2020). This supports Shopee's brand resonance, namely strengthening the brand image as an e-commerce platform pioneer in the free shipping promotion model. In the interactional aspect, Instagram uploads from Shopee Indonesia have met the criteria, and there is interaction in the comments column between the audience and the Shopee Indonesia team. Interactional messages stimulate conversation among customers (Tafesse & Wien, 2018).

The promotion can change someone's mind from previously not interested in being interested in a product and trying the product so that consumers make purchases (Hidayat, 2020). The motivation to get information about discounts or other discounted prices underlies audiences to follow the Shopee Indonesia Instagram account.

Giveaway

Giveaways are a marketing strategy that has high popularity and effectiveness. People currently live in the era of digitalization and social media. They are more interested in competing because a positive atmosphere can be created from healthy competition (Putri and Gartanti, 2021). Hamzah et al. (2022) mentioned that entertainment content aims to attract several visitors or followers, for example, by distributing gifts or giveaways to consumers or potential customers. This activity has been proven, and Instagram accounts that regularly conduct giveaways have increased their followers by 70%, attracting comments and encouraging more likes. Giveaways are often held to attract consumers. This can be interpreted as many Instagram users are interested in participating in giveaway activities to get pleasure in the form of prizes (Cahyono & Ni'mah, 2021).

Content in the form of giveaway activities was the most uploaded content by Shopee Indonesia's Instagram account throughout the research period. Content in the form of a giveaway-themed 'Giveaway Spesial Bulan Ramadan' was chosen to be the unit analyzed because it received the highest engagement as @Shopee_ID giveaway content during the research period. Shopee Indonesia has prepared a prize in the form of one iPhone 12 worth IDR 12,299,000 for one winner. The requirements include following the Instagram account @Shopee_ID; clicking a link to the Shopee app; giving a like and comment in the form of "WANT"; comment spam is not allowed, so comment once; Comments are permitted with other accounts to increase the chances of winning.

Quoted to research by Tafesse & Wien (2018), there are four indicators of transformational messages: emotional posts, brand resonance posts, experience posts, and social causes. The giveaway content fulfills two of the four mentioned indicators of a transformational message. First, emotional post, his upload can create joy and wonder (Nasution et al., 2023). Uploading Shopee giveaway content aims to spark the audience's curiosity to try to participate. The general theme of her posts is expressive emotion, for example, emotional stories, jokes, and trivia such as quizzes and games.

Second, brand resonance posts differentiate and position brands by highlighting their core identity elements, such as brand image, personality, associations, and products. Brand resonance refers to the part of brand equity

that goes above brand equity. Brand resonance focuses on the primary relationship between the customer and the brand (Saputra et al., 2021). Giveaway is the most uploaded content by the Instagram account @Shopee_ID, a way to form a brand image among audiences, and the company is also considered to build good relations with audiences actively. The content uploads of giveaways on the Shopee Indonesia Instagram account got many audience comments. Hanson et al. (2021) mention that interactional messages foster the creation of ongoing interactions with customers.

Giveaway content is increasingly being used to increase engagement on social media. The participant's Instagram account is a medium to introduce the brand to a broader audience. The giveaway can also be referred to as a form of promotion packaged in a competition. Participants who win will get a prize, while those who lose will get nothing, and their Instagram account has succeeded in becoming a promotional medium (Cahyono & Ni'mah, 2021).

Collaboration

Lai (2011) explains that collaboration is a relationship in which the parties participate reciprocally in an intentional effort to achieve a common goal. Collaborative relationships can be seen from collective goals, harmonious structure, good negotiation, interactivity, and holding on to each other (in Muhammad et al., 2017). The Key Opinion Leader (KOL) has obtained great public attention because of his qualified ability in marketing and forming public opinions (Zhao & Kong, 2017). Therefore, many well-known brands cooperate with KOL to increase brand awareness and market their products.

On Shopee Indonesia's Instagram social media account, collaborative marketing communication content with selected KOLs serves as a publication medium to disseminate product recommendation information at the 'Spill Racun Shopee Viral' event. Product recommendations from the three KOLs can be accessed via the links that have also been shown on the poster. KOL followers consider their idol's experience using the product told through their social networks to be real and relevant until there is a tendency to imitate (Syarifah et al., 2022). This upload focuses more on product recommendations, so no discounted information exists.

Collaborative content with KOL uploaded by Shopee Indonesia's Instagram account contains informational messages. Informational messages can be divided into three categories of messages comparison with competitors, informing uniqueness, and explaining facts related to the company's products and services (Tai, 2004). The message conveyed in Shopee Indonesia's Instagram uploads to the public is more oriented towards a form of soft selling, where KOL has a function as a recommendation provider, later the audience will be taken to the Shopee application via a link, where recommended products from KOL can be found there. Soft selling techniques have begun to be practiced by business people and public figures who open endorsement services (Syarifah et al., 2022).

Interactional communication is one form of communication that emphasizes feedback or responses. Processes occur when individuals use symbols to create meaning in their environment. The process occurs because

there is an exchange of meaning with feedback that connects the receiver and sender (Wardyaningrum et al., 2023). Collaborative content uploaded by the Instagram account @Shopee_ID managed to gain 108 comments. Some comments received replies from the Shopee Indonesia team, giving rise to interactions due to feedback.

A transformational advertisement associates the experience of using the advertised brand with a unique set of psychological characteristics that would only usually be associated with brand experience to the same degree as exposure to the ad (Puto and Wells, 1984). The collaborative content entitled 'Spill Poison Shopee Viral' designates three KOLs to convey their experiences using a product. Posts induce (general inference) psychological cues that trigger either positive or negative emotions in consumers (Lee & Hong, 2016).

According to Zhao & Kong (2017), Key Opinion Leader (KOL) is someone who can attract attention and influence the ideas and behavior of others.. Xiong et al. (2021) explain if KOL has specific identity characteristics, first familiarity, namely the closeness or familiarity of KOL with the audience of the communication; Second, trustworthiness, namely the ability to be trusted; Third, expertise is the knowledge, experience, or skills possessed by KOL. KOL's experience and self-branding greatly influence how audiences respond to the uploaded content.

Tips and Tricks

In Saputri & Hanifa (2021), based on LYFE Marketing and Buffer (2018), tips and tricks are part of the types of content that brands and companies can upload as part of their marketing communications strategy. These types of content are tips and tricks, quotes, tips, tutorials, blogs, live questions, humor, contests, reviews involving followers, and product promotions. Shopee is an online shopping site focusing more on mobile marketplace platforms for consumers to consumers (C2C), making it easier for people to shop and sell directly using their cell phones (Latifah et al., 2020). One content in the form of tips or tutorials uploaded during the research period and had the highest engagement was how to fold a hoodie zip concisely. The content is packaged in video uploads showing how to fold a hoodie zip. Audiences also feel how easy and fast it is to fold a zip hoodie, of course, it is very suitable for saving space in a suitcase or backpack when traveling.

Media and message strategy is the most effective in stimulating consumer engagement (Tafesse & Wien, 2018). Like its function, tips and tricks content designed by a company certainly involves specific skills utilized to impart knowledge to consumers. Several social media tools and applications can engage audience engagement through knowledge sharing. This is also a place to improve the brand image (Safko & Brake, 2009).

The message in the @Shopee_ID uploaded video contains how to fold the hoodie zip in sequence. The entire video has procedures without inserting messages regarding discounts, product recommendations, or other events. Thus, this message cannot be said to be informational because it does not contain information related to products or services. Msallati (2021) wrote that this type of informational message presents accurate information directly related to the

product or service. Meanwhile, this content upload focuses on how the audience can understand tips on folding a zip hoodie so it only takes up a little space.

Content upload tips and tricks take the role of displaying messages in the form of information. The difference is that @TikTokShop_ID rarely uploads tips and tricks content compared to @Shopee_ID. Content uploads of tips and tricks by @Shopee_ID fulfill a transformational message. Even though the entire message contains tips without using brand or service attributes, many hoodie products can be found through the Shopee platform, both sold by local MSMEs and local and international brands. In addition, these tips are closely related to consumers' daily lives. Transformational advertising links to a person's experience consuming the advertised brand (Hanson, 2021). This upload triggered the emergence of many comments, and several comments created further interaction between the audience and Shopee Indonesia.

From the data collected, transformational messages dominate content uploads from the @TikTokShop_Indonesia. Tafesse & Wien (2018) reported that transformational messages (emotional appeals) had a more significant impact on consumers than informational types. Transformational messages are consistent with consumers' emotional, self-image, and hedonic motivations to engage with content. During the research period, content uploads from the @TikTok Shop_Indonesia almost failed to create interactions through the comments column. Only in giveaway content did the TikTok Shop manage to spark the appearance of comments. At first, the interactional message strategy did not exist in the advertising typology because in the past, traditional advertising was only one-way communication (Berthon et al., 2012). Television and newspapers do not allow for two-way interactivity. On the contrary, interactivity is a hallmark of social media (Gensler et al., 2013). Overall, transformational message strategies are the most powerful drivers of consumer engagement behavior as individuals and as complementary message strategies (Tafesse & Wien, 2018).

In contrast to TikTok Shop Indonesia, Shopee Indonesia, through its Instagram account, tends to upload more interactional and transformational content. The upload of informational messages comes after that. Tafesse & Wien (2018) states that interactional messaging emphasizes social connection and community identification, consistent with the social motivation of transmitting content. However, the absence of explicit affective stimuli, such as emotional, hedonic self-image, and brand cues, may undermine the ability to generate solid behavioral engagement. So it is necessary to apply a combination of message strategies. Incorporating interactional message strategies extends the traditional typological dichotomy between informational and transformational advertising (Putto and Wells, 1984). Interactional messages are closely related to social media, thus complementing existing traditional typologies. Interactional messages are also essential in social media if the target is the millennial generation (Nasution et al., 2023).

Mixed brand uploads, i.e., that use multiple message strategies together are an important feature of brand communication through social media (Araujo et al., 2015). Rather than developing messages that are purely informational, only transformational, or only interactional, marketers prefer to use a combination of message strategies (Tafesse & Wien, 2018).

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This research was conducted to identify the characteristics of the message strategy used or implemented in Instagram content uploads belonging to @TikTokShop_Indonesia and @Shopee_ID in Ramadan 2023. As a result, content uploads on the Instagram account @TikTokShop_Indonesia tend to focus more on aspects of transformational messages. Placing informational messages is the second most important message and needs more success in attracting interaction with the audience. This means that TikTok Shop Indonesia consistently seeks to touch the emotional motivation of its consumers through consumer self-image and hedonism with the hope that consumer behavior involvement will increase. TikTok Shop Indonesia realizes that messages connecting consumers' psychology and emotions have superior power compared to interactivity and cognitive knowledge. However, establishing sustainable interactions must still be considered by them in the era of social media because interactional messages are identified as a complement to traditional advertising typologies so that they are more relevant to the current and future conditions of the advertising model.

In contrast, by uploading its content, the Instagram account @Shopee_ID places interactional and transformational messages above informational ones. This means that Shopee Indonesia has realized the importance of interactivity in today's social media era to ensure companies can connect with consumers personally. Through uploads, Shopee Indonesia emphasizes aspects of social relations and community identification and is consistent with social motivation for content transmission. To strengthen the success of the message strategy to the level of consumer involvement, transformational messages also take a flat portion with interactional messages. Shopee Indonesia combines interactional messages with transformational and informational messages to encourage the achievement of marketing communication goals.

FURTHER STUDY

This research is limited to examining the characteristics of the message strategy. It needs to examine how the message is composed, what is behind it, and how consumer satisfaction with the messages is conveyed. Also, research is limited to Instagram only, so further research is expected to be able to conduct further studies.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors **would like** to thank all the reviewers who contributed to the review process of the manuscripts in this issue. The professional support and assistance of all reputable reviewers have enabled this review to be published.

REFERENCES

- Amelia, R., & Sudrartono, T. (2023). Pemanfaatan Marketplace Shopee dalam Peningkatan Volume Penjualan Jaket Hoodie Toko Mikayla Shop. *Jurnal Informatika Ekonomi Bisnis*, 118-124. <https://doi.org/10.37034/infec.v5i1.237>
- Araujo, T., Neijens, P., & Vliegenhart, R. (2015). What motivates consumers to re-tweet brand content? The impact of information, emotion, and traceability on pass-along behavior. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 55(3), 284-295. <https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-2015-009>
- Berthon, P. R., Pitt, L. F., Plangger, K., & Shapiro, D. (2012). Marketing meets Web 2.0, social media, and creative consumers: Implications for international marketing strategy. *Business Horizons*, 55(3), 261-271. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bushor.2012.01.007>
- Cahyono, Eko Arief & Zahrotul Ni'mah. (2021). Wanprestasi Dalam Praktik Giveaway Sebagai Daya Tarik Konsumen di Instagram Perspektif Hukum Islam. *Jurnal Hukum Islam Nusantara*. Vol. 4, No. 2
- Cantika, A. Rasya & Kurnia (2023). Kesesuaian Karakteristik Key Opinion Leader (KOL) terhadap Efektifitas NCT Dream sebagai KOL Somethinc. *Prologia* 7 (1), 213-221
- Chrismardani, Y. (2014). Komunikasi Pemasaran Terpadu. *Jurnal NeO-Bis*, 8(2), 178
- Dey I. (1993) *Qualitative Data Analysis. A User-Friendly Guide for Social Scientists*. Routledge.
- Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The Qualitative Content Analysis Process. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 62(1), 107-115. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2648.2007.04569.x>
- Fadillatunnisa, & Nawawi, Z. M. (2022). Dampak Pendapatan di Bulan Suci Ramadhan Dalam Meningkatkan Penjualan (Studi kasus Pedagang Yang Berjualan di Pusat Pasar Medan). *Jurnal Ilmu Komputer, Ekonomi Dan Manajemen (JIKEM)*. 2(1), 923-926
- Faelens, Lien et al. (2021). The relationship between Instagram Use and Indicators of Mental Health: A Systematic Review. *Computers in Human Behavior Reports*, Vol. 4. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chbr.2021.100121>
- Faizaty, Nur Elisa & Rumzil Laili. (2021). Dampak Softselling dalam Digital Marketing pada Pengambilan Keputusan Pembelian (Studi pada Platform Grup Facebook Jago Jualan). *Jimek : Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Ekonomi*, 4 (1), 2621-2374.

- Fitriyah, Ainur. (2020). *Praktik Giveaway pada Online Shop di Media Instagram Perspektif Undang-Undang Nomor 11 Tahun 2008 Tentang Informasi dan Transaksi Elektronik dan Hukum Perjanjian Syariah (Studi di Kota Malang)* (Thesis) Accessed <http://etheses.uin-malang.ac.id/30885/1/15220159.pdf>
- Gensler, S. et al. (2013). Managing brands in the social media environment. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 27(4), 242–256. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intmar.2013.09.004>
- Habriyanto. (2019). *Analisis Pola Konsumsi pada Bulan Ramadhan (Studi Kasus pada Masyarakat Kota Jambi)*. (Doctoral Dissertation). Accessed <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/6356/1/Disertasi%20Habriyanto.pdf>
- Hanggraito, Ahmadintya Anggit et al. (2022). Peran Hashtag #INDONESIABUCKETLIST pada Konten Regram INDTRAVEL dalam Upaya Customer Engagement Marketing Di Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *JUMPA*, 8(2).
- Hanson, Cynthia B. Et al. (2021). Social Media Message Strategy: A Content Analysis of Sponsored Posts and Promoted Tweets. *Global Journal of Management and Marketing*, 5(1).
- Hasna, S., & Irwansyah, D. (2019). ELECTRONIC WORD OF MOUTH SEBAGAI STRATEGI PUBLIC RELATION DI ERA DIGITAL. *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, 8(1).
- Hidayat, Taufan. (2020). Analisis Pengaruh Produk, Harga, Promosi dan Lokasi terhadap Keputusan Pembelian. *Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen*, 17(2).
- Hootsuite 'Digital Report 2023'. (2023, February 9). Accessed <https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2023-indonesia>
- Jackson et al. (2021). Analisis Key Opinion Leaders Di Media Sosial Dalam Membentuk Opini Khalayak. *Journal of Clinical Oncology* 5 (1), 90–97.
- Kim, S., & Park, H. (2013). Effects of Various Characteristics of Social Commerce (s-commerce) on Consumers' Trust and Trust Performance. *International Journal of Information Management*, 33(2), 318–332. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2012.11.006>
- Kotler, Philip. (2014). *Manajemen Pemasaran Edisi 13*. Jilid 2. Prenhalindo.
- Kotler, P. & Keller, K.L. (2012), *Manajemen Pemasaran Jilid I Edisi ke 12*. Erlangga.
- Laskey, H. A., Day, E., & Crask, M. R. (1989). Typology of main message strategies for television commercials. *Journal of Advertising*, 18(1), 36–41. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.1989.10673141>
- Latif, Farid Reynaldi Diva & Asmai Ishak. (2022). Faktor-faktor yang Mempengaruhi Belanja Online Berbasis Smartphone: Sebuah Studi Empiris

- dari Pembelanja Wanita Muda di Indonesia. *Selekta Manajemen: Jurnal Mahasiswa Bisnis & Manajemen*, 1(3), 249-265.
- Latifah et al., (2020). Pengaruh Perceived Usefulness dan Trust terhadap Kepuasan Konsumen pada E-Commerce Shopee. *Bisma: Jurnal Bisnis dan Manajemen*, 14(1), 82 – 91.
- Lee, J. E., & Chen-Yu, J. H. (2018). Effects of a price discount on consumers' perceptions of savings, quality, and value for apparel products: the mediating effect of price discount effect. *Fashion and Textiles*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40691-018-0128-2>
- Lee, J., & Hong, I. B. (2016). Predicting positive user responses to social media advertising: The roles of emotional appeal, informativeness, and creativity. *International Journal of Information Management*, 36(3), 360–373. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2016.01.001>
- Lestari, Sinta Petri. (2015). Hubungan Komunikasi Pemasaran dan Promosi dengan Keputusan Memilih Jasa Layanan Kesehatan (Studi pada Rumah Sakit Islam Lumajang). *JURNAL INTERAKSI*, 4(2), 139 - 147
- Lestari, Ade Hapsari. (2023, March 17). *Jelang Ramadan, E-Commerce Mana yang Paling Unggul?*. Accessed <https://www.medcom.id/ekonomi/ekonomi-digital/VNnMzrJK-jelang-ramadan-e-commerce-mana-yang-paling-unggul>
- Luarn, P., Lin, Y. F., & Chiu, Y. P. (2015). Influence of Facebook brand-page posts on online engagement. *Online Information Review*, 39(4), 505–519. <https://doi.org/10.1108/OIR-01-2015-0029>
- Istiqomah, Mira & Novi Marlina. (2020). Pengaruh promo gratis ongkos kirim dan online customer rating terhadap keputusan pembelian produk fashion. *JURNAL MANAJEMEN*, 12 (2), 288-298
- Hamzah, Radja Erland et al. (2022). Pengelolaan Konten Media Sosial Sebagai Sarana Pemasaran Usaha Kecil Warga Kampung Anyar, Kabupaten Bogor. *Jurnal Pustaka Dianmas*, 2 (2), 64-70
- Moleong, Lexy J. (2012). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Monggilo, Zainuddin Muda Z. (2020). ANALISIS KONTEN KUALITATIF HOAKS DAN LITERASI DIGITAL DALAM @KOMIKFUNDAY. *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, 9(1).
- Moon, N. N., Talha, I. M., & Salehin, I. (2021). An advanced intelligence system in customer online shopping behavior and satisfaction analysis. *Current Research in Behavioral Sciences*, 2. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.crbeha.2021.100051>

- Msallati, A. (2021). Investigating the nexus between the types of advertising messages and customer engagement: Do customer involvement and generations matter? *Journal of Innovations in Digital Marketing*, 2(1), 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.51300/jidm-2021-31>
- Muhammad, Adji Suradji et al. (2017). Collaborative Governance Model in Managing International Borders in Riau Islands Province Using Partial Least Squares Method. *JKAP (Jurnal Kebijakan dan Administrasi Publik)*, 21 (2), 155-167
- Nainggolan, Novitasari & Taufik Parinduri. (2020). Pengaruh Potongan Harga dan Bonus terhadap Keputusan Pembelian Konsumen Minimarket Indomaret Serbelawan. *MANAJEMEN : JURNAL EKONOMI USI*, 2(1)
- Nasution, J., Nurhayati, N., & Marliyah, M. (2023). Campaigning Zakat on Social Media: The Role of Message Strategies in the Decision to Pay Zakat. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, 8(1), 53. <https://doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v8i1.1258>
- Nur, A., & Anggi Pasca Arnu. (2021). Pengaruh promosi dan harga terhadap proses keputusan pembelian konsumen. *FORUM EKONOMI*, 23(3), 383-390. <http://journal.feb.unmul.ac.id/index.php/FORUM EKONOMI>
- Pandrianto, Nigar & Gregorius Genep Sukendro. (2018). Analisis Strategi Pesan Content Marketing Untuk Mempertahankan Brand Engagement. *Jurnal Komunikasi* 10(2), 167 - 176.
- Polit D.F. & Beck C.T. (2003) *Nursing Research. Principles and Methods*. Lippincott Williams & Wilkins. Philadelphia, PA.
- Prasetya, Chandra Saha Dewa. (2017). Sistem Rekomendasi pada E-Commerce Menggunakan K-Nearest Neighbor. *Jurnal Teknologi Informasi dan Ilmu Komputer (JTIK)*, 4(3), 194-200
- Pratiwi, D., Hermawati, A., & Kurniawati, D. (2023). Pengaruh Content Marketing, Influencer, dan Free Ongkir terhadap Minat Beli Konsumen Produk Fashion pada TikTok Shop. *JIMP*, 3(1): 1 - 11
- Prawitasari, A., Susanto, ,, Denny, ,, & Ardiyanto, T. (2020). Comparative Study of Post-Marriage Nationality Of Women in Legal Systems of Different Countries Mass Media Instagram in the Perspective of Popular Culture International. *Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding Mass Media Instagram in the Perspective of Popular Culture*. <https://doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i5.1600>
- Puto, C.P. and Wells, W.D. (1984), Informational and Transformational Advertising: The Differential Effects of Time. *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 11, 638-643. Accessed

<https://www.acrwebsite.org/volumes/6323/volumes/v11/NA%20-%202011>

- Putri, L. N. S., & Susilowati, I. H. (2017). Pelaksanaan Promosi Melalui Media Sosial Instagram Pada Toko Zizara Depok. *Cakrawala*, 17(2), 226–236.
- Putri, Vigni Rusmayadi & Wulan Tri Gartanti. (2021). Program Giveaway sebagai Strategi MPR Adeeva Skincare dalam Memasarkan Produk melalui Instagram. *Prosiding Hubungan Masyarakat*, 7(1).
- Rahayu, Mayang Manguri et al. (2023). Analisis Keputusan Pembelian pada Online Shopping Selama Bulan Ramadan: Studi Kasus pada Konsumen Muslim di Indonesia. *KOMITMEN: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 4(1).
- Rashkova, Y., Moi, L., Marku, E., & Cabiddu, F. (2023). Online integrated marketing communication strategies of international brands: standardization vs. adaptation approaches. *Journal of Marketing Communications*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13527266.2023.2177710>
- Rumata, Vience Mutiara. (2017). A Qualitative Content Analysis of Twitter “#TaxAmnesty” and “#AmnestiPajak.” *JURNAL PIKOM (Penelitian Komunikasi dan Pembangunan)*, 18(1)
- Safko, Lon., & Brake, D. K. (2009). *The Social Media Bible: Tactics, Tools, and Strategies for Business Success*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Saputra, M. H., Ardyan, E., Tanesia, C. Y., & Ariningsih, E. P. (2021). Building Brand Resonance: Optimizing Symbolic Brand Reputation and Customers’ Emotional Value. *ASEAN Marketing Journal*, 13(2). <https://doi.org/10.21002/amj.v13i2.13543>
- Saputri, P. S., & Hanifa, F. H. (2021). Analisis dan Pengembangan Konten Sosial Media Marketing pada Instagram Telkom STO Dago Tahun 2021. *E-Proceeding of Applied Science*, 7(4).
- Suka, Enda Aulia Akbar Ginting & Suwardi Lubis. (2019). Strategi Komunikasi Pemasaran Dalam Mempromosikan Produk Homemade Kefir di Kota Medan. *Jurnal Network Media*, 2(2).
- Survei: 45% Masyarakat Indonesia Doyan Belanja di TikTok Shop. (2022, September 23). Accessed <https://kumparan.com/kumparantech/survei-45-masyarakat-indonesia-doyan-belanja-di-tiktok-shop-1yuKNSdzT2z>
- Syarifah et al. (2022). Pengaruh Soft Selling dalam Media Sosial Instagram dan Celebrity Endorse Terhadap Keputusan Pembelian. *Jurnal Bisnis dan Kajian Strategi Manajemen*, 6 (1).
- Tafesse, W., & Wien, A. (2018). Implementing Social Media Marketing Strategically: An Empirical Assessment. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 34(9–10), 732–749. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2018.1482365>

- Tafesse, W., & Wien, A. (2018). Using Message Strategy to Drive Consumer Behavioral Engagement on Social Media. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 35(3), 241–253. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JCM-08-2016-1905>
- Tai, S. H. C. (2004). The Relationship of Cultural Values and Message Strategies in Service Advertising. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 22(4), 438–454. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02634500410542798>
- Tampanguma, K. S. et al. (2020). Kolaborasi Bisnis terhadap Pendapatan Pengelolaan Captikus di Desa Lalumpe. *Productivity*, 1(4).
- Tania, Cinthya & Vina Benita Laksono. (2022). Strategi Pesan Persuasif di Media Sosial Instagram @somethincofficia. *AVANT GARDE*, 10 (1), 30-45.
- Tusanputri, Alyasinta Viela & Amron. (2021). Pengaruh Iklan dan Program Gratis Ongkir terhadap Keputusan Pembelian pada Platform e-commerce Tiktok Shop. *FORUM EKONOMI*, 23 (4), 632-639
- Wardyaningrum, D. et al. (2023). Interactional Communication in Developing Digital Marketing during Pandemic Era. *Komunikator*, 15(1), 68–79. <https://doi.org/10.18196/jkm.18255>
- Xiong, L., Cho, V., Law, K. M. Y., & Lam, L. (2021). A Study of KOL Effectiveness on Brand Image of Skincare Products. *Enterprise Information Systems*, 15(10), 1483–1500. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17517575.2021.1924864>
- Yin, X., & Huang, J. (2014). Effects of Price Discounts and Bonus Packs on Online Impulse Buying. *Social Behavior & Personality: An International Journal*, 42(8), 1293–1302. <https://doi.org/10.2224/sbp.2014.42.8.1293>
- Yuanita, D. (2021). Peran Key Opinion Leader dalam Strategi Public Relations pada Komunikasi Krisis Perusahaan. *PRofesi Humas*, 6(1), 23–44
- Zhao, F., & Kong, Y. (2017). Discovering Social Network Key Opinion Leaders Based Psychology Theory in Social. *International Journal of Management and Applied Science (IJMAS)* 3(9), 43–49.