



Collaborative Governance: Illegal Parking and Its Management

Reza Nurahman¹, Siti Fatimah², Azhar Nur Aulia Pizah³, Siti Khumayah^{4*},
Rahmayanti⁵

University of Swadaya Gunung Jati

Corresponding Author: Siti Khumayah, siti.khumayah@ugj.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Collaborative Governance, Coordination, Illegal Parking, Hexahelix, Participation

Received: 30, May

Revised: 15, June

Accepted: 16, July

©2025 Nurahman, Fatimah, Pizah, Khumayah, Rahmayanti: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

The rapid economic growth in Cirebon City, especially in the trade and service sectors, is not balanced by the availability of adequate parking lots, thus causing an increase in illegal parking that disrupts traffic order. This study aims to analyze the application of collaborative governance in dealing with the problem of illegal parking in Cirebon City, especially in traffic order areas such as Jalan Dr. Sudarsono and Jalan Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo. The method used in this study is a descriptive qualitative approach, with data collection techniques through observation of illegal parking locations, in-depth interviews with stakeholders, and document studies related to parking policies. The data obtained were analyzed using Ansell & Gash's collaborative governance model, which includes four dimensions: initial conditions, institutional design, facilitative leadership, and collaborative processes, which are further classified in a hexahelix framework (government, private, academic, community, mass media, and society). The results of the study show that the collaboration carried out by the Parking Unit with various stakeholders has not run optimally, due to: (1) weak coordination between agencies, (2) limited resources in regulatory enforcement, (3) lack of active participation of several hexahelix elements in the decision-making process, and (4) the absence of strict sanctions against illegal parking violators. This study recommends the need to strengthen the role of facilitative leadership and increase the effectiveness of collaborative processes through regular discussion forums and feedback mechanisms involving all elements of hexahelix.

INTRODUCTION

The city of Cirebon is experiencing very rapid economic growth both in the trade and service sectors, this can be seen from the number of shopping centers, shops, and services and services available. However, the development is not accompanied by an adequate amount of parking space, resulting in illegal parking. In this study, the term "illegal parking" was chosen compared to "off-street parking" because this term is more familiar and commonly used in society as well as the literature related to the phenomenon of unofficial parking. This term is already inherent as a description of the phenomenon of parking that is carried out illegally or unofficially, which occurs outside of government supervision and is often a traffic and urban planning problem. This has resulted in quite serious problems related to the rampant illegal parking that disrupts traffic order in Cirebon City. This illegal parking activity often occurs in various main locations and causes significant congestion such as densely populated areas and economic centers. In addition to causing congestion, this illegal parking activity causes environmental impacts such as causing noise and air pollution, damage to public facilities such as sidewalks. This ignores existing regulations, including Regional Regulation No. 11 of 2019 concerning the Implementation of Parking (Cirebon City Regional Government, 2019). The handling efforts that have been carried out by the Cirebon City government are often hampered by limited resources and lack of coordination between related agencies. The central statistics agency (Statistics, 2023) stated that the number of vehicles in the city of Cirebon was 130,009 motorcycles and 29,964 cars. This causes frequent vehicle parking activities in the city of Cirebon every day. In addition, there is an increase in mobility between people and goods from one region to another.

The problem of Illegal Parking in Cirebon City is very complex, especially parking activities on Jl. Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo which have been going on for a long time, this area is crowded with people because there are Malls, Restaurants, Schools, Electronic Stores, Coffeshops, Offices, and many more, moreover some shop buildings that only have parking spaces for two-wheelers so that it aggravates traffic and results in careless parking or parking is not where it should be. Moreover, after the new policy of using e-money for parking in the mall, this policy has an impact on two-wheeled riders who have difficulty if they want to visit the mall because they do not have e-money so they decide to park on land that is not supposed to be for parking. In addition, illegal parking also occurs in the school area, precisely at SMAN 2 every afternoon, which is caused by parents/guardians picking up their sons. Therefore, in handling it, various efforts are needed from various agencies, so to overcome it a Collaborative Governance process is needed. *Collaborative Governance* According to (Ansell and Gash 2008) by (Syaiful, 2018) is an approach that involves various stakeholders from the public and private sectors in a collective forum in public institutions. This approach focuses on consensus-based decision-making. Therefore, collaboration in governance serves as a regulator involving one or more public institutions as well as non-state stakeholders in a formal decision-making process that is collective, deliberative, and consensus-oriented, with the aim of

formulating or implementing public policies and managing public programs or assets.

The concept of Hexahelix according to (Lindmark et al., 2009) explains that it is a collaborative approach that must integrate six key stakeholder elements in resolving public issues. This concept is the result of collaboration between Quadruple Helix and Quintuple Helix innovation, which can be a solution to accelerate the implementation of programs that have been set through synergy between the elements involved (Firmansyah et al., 2022). This concept has shown its success when implemented in various aspects of urban development. For example, (Firmansyah et al., 2022) recorded the successful application of hexahelix in an effort to revitalize historical areas in the city of Surabaya. The application of the Hexahelix Concept in the handling of illegal parking has never been comprehensively researched. The socio-economic characteristics and urban governance in Cirebon are very supportive to implement this collaborative concept. Therefore, this study aims to examine how the Hexahelix collaboration concept can be applied in overcoming the problem of illegal parking in Cirebon City. The Hexahelix collaboration can be applied in overcoming the problem of illegal parking in Cirebon City.

LITERATURE REVIEW

This research covers important themes such as; New Public Management, Collaborative Governance, Public Policy, Policy Implementation, and the Issue of Illegal Parking.

New Public Management

According to (Hood, 1991), New Public Management (NPM) is a public sector management approach that emerged in the late 1980s and early 1990s. NPM is a response to the need for public service reform, with a focus on efficiency, effectiveness, and the application of private sector management principles into the public sector. NPM also highlights aspects of decentralization, competition, and a focus on results in the delivery of public services. The essence of NPM is the transformation of traditional bureaucracy that tends to be rigid and hierarchical into a more flexible, responsive, and customer-oriented organization. In addition, According to (Denhardt & Denhardt, 2000)), New Public Management (NPM) is a paradigm in public administration that focuses on the efficiency, effectiveness, and application of private sector management principles in the public sector. NPM is often described as an approach that positions public managers as "entrepreneurs" who steer government organizations toward a leaner, privatized structure. This approach seeks to "steer" public organizations rather than "rowing" services directly.

Collaborative Governance

The term collaborative governance according to (Ansell and Gash, 2008) by (Astuti, R.S., Warsono, H., & Rachim, 2020) is a governance management procedure that involves stakeholders directly both in the government and outside the government, oriented towards consensus and deliberation in the collective decision-making process that aims to implement or make public

policies and other public programs. According to (Tilano, Aldi & Suwitri, 2019) Ansell and Gash also explain that collaborative governance is a set of rules that involve one or more public institutions and directly involve non-state stakeholders in the policy-making process that is formal, consensus-oriented, and deliberative. Its purpose is to formulate or implement public policies and manage public programs and assets. According to Ansell and Gash, collaborative governance is a policy process carried out by several public institutions together with other related parties, either directly or indirectly, with the aim of overcoming public problems.

His journal entitled "Collaborative Governance in Theory and Praticce," (Ansell & Gash, 2008) formulated a collaborative model based on a literature review. In the study, there are several indicators in the collaborative governance process , consisting of (1) initial conditions; (2) institutional design; (3) leadership; (4) collaborative processes. According to De Seve in Sudarmo (2011:11), by (Solikhin, 2019) that one of the indicators of the success of collaborative governance is the existence of a high level of trust among actors. This trust is formed through professional and social relationships, where the perpetrators rely on each other's information and efforts made by other parties in the network to achieve a common goal. For government agencies, this element is crucial because they need to believe that they can rely on partners, both from within the government and from outside, to carry out mutually agreed activities.

According to (Astuti, R.S., Warsono, H., & Rachim, 2020) collaboration between government agencies and the private sector has been a major concern in various literatures, which suggests that these partnerships emerged earlier than collaboration between government and society. The business sector is often seen as having superior traditions and values in terms of efficiency and innovation compared to government agencies. The positive image of the business sector is often a consideration for the government to improve its efficiency and responsiveness. In addition, these partnerships also often serve as political symbols that reflect the government's concern for improving the quality of public services. Through this collaboration, it is hoped that the government will get a positive assessment from the public.

Hexahelix

The concept of Hexahelix according to (Lindmark et al., 2009) is a collaborative approach involving six main stakeholders, namely, the Government, the private sector, academics, organizations or communities, mass media, and society. The goal of this model is to create more effective synergies in achieving sustainable development goals. According to (Firmansyah et al., 2022) explains that hexahelix can be understood as a qualitative synthesis of quadruple and quantuple helix collaboration, which emphasizes the importance of optimizing the role of each actor in the development process.

The success of the Hexahelix model relies heavily on strong synergy and commitment among stakeholders. This model not only facilitates the achievement of empowerment goals, but also serves to prevent overlap of policies and programs among the parties involved. This is especially important given the complexity of the challenges faced in today's builders.

The hexahelix model has been applied in various sectors, including in the development of a creative digital ecosystem in Malang City. In this context, collaboration between the Government, the private sector, academics, organizations or communities, mass media, and the public is crucial to create innovation and sustainable economic growth (Anisykurlillah, 2024). In addition, hexahelix also plays a role in poverty alleviation efforts by involving all actors to formulate more inclusive and effective solutions.

Public Policy

According to James E. Anderson by (Maulana & Nugroho, 2019) public policy is defined as "A series or steps aimed at and implemented by an individual or group of individuals in addressing an issue or matter that is the focus of attention." which means a series of actions aimed at and carried out by an actor or a group of actors in dealing with a certain problem. From this explanation, it is emphasized that the public policy has 5 important implications, namely, (1) each policy has specific goals to be achieved; (2) policies consist of a series of actions or patterns of actions carried out by government officials; (3) policies reflect what is actually implemented by the government, not just desires or plans; (4) policies can be positive or negative; (5) Public policies, especially those that are positive, are based on the law so that they have an authoritative nature.

These implications can reflect the view (Anderson, 2003) that public policy is the product of a political process that involves certain actors in dealing with social problems, taking into account the various alternatives and consequences of the actions taken. In this context, public policy includes not only the decision to act, but also the decision not to act, which also has a significant impact on society.

Policy Implementation

Policy implementation according to (Tachjan, 2006) is one of the crucial elements in the policy process, because without efficient implementation, the decisions taken by policymakers will not be implemented properly. Policy implementation activities arise after the official direction of a policy, which includes managing inputs to produce outputs or outcomes that are beneficial to the community. Policies generally include programs designed to achieve specific goals, as well as values embodied through planned actions. The goal is so that after a public policy is determined and implemented, its positive impact can be widely felt by the community, including by the policymakers themselves. In addition to having goals that must be achieved, the state as a public institution must also face problems that need to be addressed. These problems arise from the community itself and are a negative consequence of government decisions.

Implementation, according to (Amin and Pratiwi, 2015) by (Khumayah, 2021) is a stage that involves various sources, such as human resources, finance, and organizational capabilities. This stage is carried out by the government and the private sector, both individually and collectively, with the aim of achieving targets that have been previously set by policy makers. Meanwhile, according to (Widodo, 2001) by (Nurlailah, 2021) it is stated that policy implementation is a

crucial element in the overall policy process, because public policies that have been formulated will only provide benefits if implemented properly. A policy program needs to be implemented in order to achieve the expected impact or outcome. The implementation process is considered an interaction between a set of objectives and actions designed to achieve the goals of a policy.

Edward III by (Laary et al., 2022) stated that the implementation of policies is a very important stage, because how effectively a policy can be implemented will depend on careful preparation and planning. Without good preparation, the goals of public policy will not be achieved. On the other hand, even if the preparation and implementation of the policy is well done, if the policy itself is not formulated appropriately, then the desired goals will not be realized either. Edward emphasized that policy involves a complex interaction between various factors that influence each other. In the policy implementation model developed, there are four main factors that need to be considered, namely: (1) Positioning, (2) Communication, (3) Resources, and (4) Bureaucratic Structure.

Illegal Parking

According to (Mohammad Riyan Hidayatulloh, 2023) Illegal parking refers to the practice of stopping carried out by drivers in a certain location for a certain period of time without a permit. Drivers tend to choose to park their vehicles close to the location of the activity they are doing. The phenomenon of illegal parking often occurs during large events, as well as in crowded areas, especially in large cities. This is due to the lack of parking facilities provided by the event organizers, so that the surrounding community uses vacant land to be used as a parking lot. At large events, illegal parking often takes advantage of the shoulder of the road, which negatively impacts the flow of traffic due to road narrowing. In addition, this can also reduce the speed of passing vehicles and cause congestion due to road cuts used for parking. Thus, illegal parking that utilizes the shoulder of the road is clearly detrimental to other road users.

According to (Directorate General of Land Transportation, 1996) in the research performance report, there are several definitions of parking that, (1) Parking is a non-moving vehicle that is a temporary vehicle. (2) Stopping is the temporary immobility of a vehicle with the driver not leaving the vehicle. (3) Parking facilities are locations that are determined as a place to stop vehicles that are not temporary to carry out activities for a certain period of time. (4) Parking facilities on the road body are parking facilities that use the roadside. (5) Off-road parking facilities are vehicle parking facilities outside the public roadside that are specially made or support activities that can be in the form of parking lots or parking buildings.

This ignores Law No. 22 of 2009 concerning traffic and road transportation (Ministry of Transportation, 2009), as well as Cirebon City Regulation No. 11 of 2019 concerning the implementation of parking considering that in accordance with article 43 paragraph (3) Parking Facilities in Road Owned Spaces can only be held in certain places on district roads, village roads, or city roads that must be declared with Traffic Signs, and/or Road Markings. and paragraph (4) Further provisions regarding Road Users of Parking facilities, licensing, maintenance and procedures for the operation of facilities and Parking for the

public are regulated by government regulations. Law No. 22 of 2009 concerning Road Traffic and Transportation.

METHODOLOGY

The method used by the author in this study is qualitative and descriptive. Using a descriptive qualitative approach, research results can be obtained directly from respondents through questions asked by researchers. This process involves analysis and exploration aimed at understanding individuals and their perspectives on a particular issue. The data collection technique used is to use the triangulation technique (a combination of observation, interview, documentation) to obtain valid and comprehensive data (Sugiyono, 2013). ; (1) Observation, the researcher conducted direct observation of the implementation of parking on several roads in Cirebon City. Observations are carried out to obtain a real picture of the implementation of parking. (2) Interviews, the researcher conducted in-depth interviews with related parties, such as the Transportation Department (the government), the Penabur Christian Education Agency Foundation (private sector), the Head of the Urban and Regional Planning Study Program of Swadaya Gunung Jati University (academics), Radar Cirebon (the media), BEM KM Swadaya Gunung Jati University, (the community) and the community. This interview aims to obtain direct information from various sources. (3) Document Study, Researchers collect and study related documents, such as local regulations, and other supporting data. The document study was carried out to complement the data obtained from observations and interviews. The validity test of the data in this study is carried out through a series of systematic steps to ensure that the information obtained is accurate and trustworthy. First, the researcher applied source triangulation, where data was collected from various sources, including the government, academics, media, and the public. The verified data were then analyzed using the collaborative governance method proposed by (Ansell & Gash 2008), namely, (1) initial conditions; (2) institutional design; (3) leadership; (4) collaborative processes.

RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study aims to analyze the implementation of Collaborative Governance in overcoming illegal parking in Cirebon City. The Collaborative Theory used as analysis material is the Collaborative Governance theory according to Ansell and Gash (2008) by (Apriadi et al., 2023) which includes 4 (four) dimensions, namely: initial conditions, institutional design, facilitative leadership, and collaborative processes which are then classified based on the concept of hexahelix collaboration. The following are the results of research on each dimension of Collaborative Governance in overcoming illegal parking in Cirebon City.

Existing Conditions

Cirebon City faces a significant problem of illegal parking, especially in high-density Traffic Orderly Areas such as on Jalan Dr. Sudarsono and Jalan Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo. The increasing growth in the number of vehicles' due to

the abundance of shopping malls and services without being balanced by the provision of adequate parking spaces creates critical initial conditions. This leads to a violation of Regional Regulation No. 11 of 2019 concerning the implementation of parking, which should be a reference in official parking arrangements. In the research performance report, the Government as the main actor who holds the interest of a Hexahelix Collaboration is the Department of Transportation.

The government, according to the Cirebon City Transportation Office through the Parking UPT, explained that the occurrence of parking activities on the shoulder of the road is the result of the lack of available parking spaces and also the lack of awareness from its human resources. Even though traffic order area signs and parking prohibitions have been installed on every road that is included in the traffic order area. Please note that the traffic order area in Cirebon City is divided into 6 road sections, namely; Jl. Dr. Sudarsono, Jl. Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo, Jl. Pemuda Raya, Jl. Dr. Wahidin Sudirohusodo, Jl. Siliwangi, and Jl. R.A. Kartini.

Privately, the Head of the BPK Secretariat Penabur stated that during his 37 years of teaching, the school had never experienced a problem of illegal parking in front of the school, except when parents picked up students. However, lately he has been surprised by the number of vehicles parked on the shoulder of Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo's road, especially in front of the BPK Penabur school. This happened after the implementation of a new parking system in one of the shopping centers about a few months ago, which then resulted in parking activities considering that previously there were no parking activities at the location.

According to the Head of the Regional and Urban Planning Study Program, the cause of illegal parking activities is due to the lack of adequate parking space provided by service and service business owners. This causes visitors to be forced to park in places where they should not, such as on the shoulder of the road or areas where parking is prohibited.

Community, according to the Vice President of BEM KM UGJ, one of the main causes of illegal parking is inadequate infrastructure. The construction of buildings from several large agencies is often not balanced with adequate parking space capacity with the increase in the number of vehicles that come. For example, at the Gunung Jati Regional General Hospital, the number of patients comes from various cities, not accompanied by an increase in parking lot capacity so that the need for parking space increases. This is exacerbated by the condition of the road shoulder which should not be used for recreational activities but instead the shoulder of the road is filled with hospital visitors.

Mass Media, Determination of Traffic Order Areas does not run properly on Jl Dr Sudarsono. There are many different types of violations, ranging from parking on two sides, to the activities of illegal parking attendants. Monitoring from (Haryadi, 2019) by Radar Cirebon, on Jl Sudarsono has actually been installed a sign prohibiting illegal parking. But it is ignored by the community and illegal parking attendants. A similar scene can be seen on Jl Dr Cipto Mangunkusumo, One of the most highlighted is the illegal parking pocket in

front of one of the shopping centers (Rusmanta, 2024). The Cirebon City Transportation Office revealed that the mall manager's policy affects the behavior of visitors, which results in them choosing to park their vehicles outside the mall area. Previously, illegal parking only occurred on the shoulder of the road, but now it has expanded to fill the sidewalks. This situation has been going on for the past few months. One of the main reasons, according to the Transportation Agency, is because the requirement for parking inside the shopping center requires the use of e-money. Motorcyclists who do not have an e-money card finally choose to park their vehicles on the side of the road.

According to road users around the traffic orderly area, this parking activity that occurs on Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo street has been going on since the mall manager issued a policy on the use of e-money cards, and this policy has an impact on two-wheeled riders because, not all two-wheeled vehicles have e-money. A similar thing happened on the Dr. Sudarsono road section where many four-wheeled vehicles were parked on the shoulder of the road due to the lack of parking space provided by the hospital. The existence of this parking activity is very troubling to the community, both pedestrians and road users. In addition, the occurrence of this parking activity can even result in traffic congestion, especially during peak hours. They hope that the Transportation Office can pay more attention and carry out regular supervision so that parking activities can be resolved immediately.

Institutional Design

Institutional design to address the problem of illegal parking in Cirebon needs to involve various stakeholders, including local governments and the private sector.

The government, UPT Parking as a government institution has an important role in formulating policies and implementing them. In terms of following up on a complaint about parking problems, the UPT Pakir always coordinates between related institutions (Satpol PP, Law Enforcement Officers and also the Private Sector). The Parking Unit has often conducted various socializations with illegal parking perpetrators, but what is still an obstacle for the Parking Unit is due to the lack of public awareness and the need for cooperation that must be strengthened so that the policy runs effectively

Privately, BPK Penabur said that, previously they had made an agreement with the manager of the shopping center that activities in the mall would not interfere with school activities, because in the regulation (Regional Government of Cirebon City, 2012) it is stated that there is a regulation that does not allow the existence of a mall next to the school. Then the government has given permission, but he stated that if something happens, the government will immediately contact the manager of the shopping center to follow up on the existing problems.

From the results of in-depth interviews between researchers and informants, it can be concluded that the most dominant actors are the Government and the Private Sector, while from the results of the research, it was found that other actors such as Academics, Communities, Mass Media and the

Community do not have competence in explaining institutional designs related to illegal parking.

Facilitative Leadership

Facilitative leadership is needed to encourage collaboration between the government and the community in tackling illegal parking.

The government, the Parking Unit as a collaboration actor has conducted socialization and reprimands to illegal parking perpetrators, but it is often not well received by the community. Leadership that is able to build trust and good communication between the government and the community will be very influential in creating mutually beneficial solutions. Therefore, leaders need to facilitate open dialogue to understand the needs of the community and find a middle way.

In the private sector, the Head of the BPK Penabur foundation has held hearings with several agencies, both academic, government, and shopping centers. However, in the meeting, the shopping center who attended was only represented by security officers, and marketing officials. However, the collaboration process still cannot produce an effective output.

From the results of in-depth interviews between researchers and informants, it can be concluded that the most dominant actors are the Government and the Private Sector, while from the results of the research, it turns out that other actors such as Academics, Communities, Mass Media and the Community do not have the competence to explain facilitative leadership related to illegal parking.

Collaboration Process

The collaborative process should involve the active participation of all stakeholders in a decision-making regarding parking arrangements. Parking UPTs can leverage the Hexahelix approach involving six stakeholder elements to solve public issues, including illegal parking. This collaborative effort can create a mutual agreement on parking lot use and law enforcement against illegal parking.

The government, the Transportation Agency through the Parking Unit have tried to establish cooperation with various parties. One of the efforts made is to hold an audience with mall managers to find solutions to parking problems that have recently arisen in the area. However, until now, there have been no concrete results from the meeting. In addition, the Parking Unit has also sent a letter to the Gunung Jati Hospital to follow up on issues related to parking activities carried out by parking attendants along Jl Dr. Sudarsono, but the letter did not receive a response from the hospital.

Privately, BPK Penabur has conducted socialization and discussion regarding the problem of illegal parking that occurs, because BPK Penabur has rules related to this. However, lately there have been another violations. A few days earlier, the school received reports from the community about parking activities in front of the shoulder of the school road. The BPK Penabur security team has also reprimanded and discussed with related parties to handle this issue.

Academic, the Head of the regional and urban planning study program, as a representative of academics, recommended that the Parking Unit collaborate with various agencies, including the government, the private sector, academics, and the community, to overcome the problem of illegal parking that has recently disrupted traffic order. According to him, the government also needs to implement sanctions against illegal parking perpetrators and illegal parking attendants, so that it can provide a deterrent effect to those who violate.

Community, The problem of illegal parking that occurs in traffic orderly areas, especially on Jalan Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo and Jalan Dr. Sudarsono, requires serious attention through cooperation between government agencies, the private sector, academics, communities, and the community. This issue has attracted the attention of the public because of its great impact on the smooth flow of traffic on both roads. To solve this problem, solid collaboration is needed between various government agencies and other institutions, especially from the Transportation Office.

Mass Media, Radar Cirebon as Mass Media is a connector of information from the Transportation Department to the public, but the mass media is not directly involved in the collaboration process or decision-making process.

Community, Collaboration between various agencies has a crucial role in building synergy between the government and related institutions. This aims to overcome the problem of illegal parking that occurs on the shoulder of the road more effectively. In addition, the relevant agencies (the Transportation Agency through the Parking UPT) also need to take firm steps in providing sanctions to illegal parking perpetrators, so that it is expected to have a deterrent effect and prevent the recurrence of inappropriate parking activities.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Cirebon City is currently facing serious challenges in the management of vehicle parking. With rapid economic growth, the number of vehicles has increased rapidly without being balanced by the availability of sufficient parking spaces. This has led to the rise of illegal parking in various locations, especially in congested areas such as Jl Dr Sudarsono and Jl Dr Cipto Mangunkusumo, which ultimately causes congestion and disrupts the smooth flow of traffic.

After conducting in-depth research, it shows that the existing institutional structure has not been able to provide effective solutions. A new, more collaborative approach is needed, where all stakeholders can participate in the decision-making process. This approach must prioritize inclusive policy development and based on accurate data in the field.

To achieve effective collaboration, a facilitative leadership role is essential. Leaders need to create a supportive atmosphere in conducting structured dialogue between various parties. In addition to leading, they must also build and maintain trust among all stakeholders. Without strong and visionary leadership, collaborative efforts will be difficult to achieve desired results.

Success in dealing with the problem of illegal parking in Cirebon City is highly dependent on the effectiveness of the collaborative process itself. This process should be based on open and transparent communication. The

establishment of discussion forums and the development of effective and efficient mechanisms can be a driver for increased community participation. In addition, a focus on achieving consensus in every decision-making will ensure that the resulting solutions reflect the interests of all parties and can be implemented with the full support of all elements of society.

ADVANCED RESEARCH

Further research is recommended to explore effective multi-stakeholder collaboration models to address illegal parking in Cirebon City, involving the government, community, and private sector. Furthermore, a deeper study of the role of facilitative leadership in building trust and participation among stakeholders is also important. The use of information technology, such as a data-driven digital parking system, can be a focus of research to support more accurate and transparent policy-making. Furthermore, an evaluation of the social and economic impacts of implemented parking policies, as well as a study of community behavior and culture regarding illegal parking, is necessary to ensure that the resulting solutions are more effective, sustainable, and accepted by all elements of society.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, J. E. (2003). Public Policymaking. In J. Woy, K. Meisenheimer, T. Lobato, A. Mason, & L. Frost (Eds.), *Sustainability (Switzerland)* (5 edition, Vol. 5, Issue 1). Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Anisykurlillah, R. (2024). Kolaborasi Hexahelix dalam Pengembangan Ekosistem Digital Kreatif di Kota Malang Hexahelix Collaboration on Creative Digital Ecosystem Development in Malang City. *Jurnal Penelitian Administrasi Publik*, 9(2), 187–200. <https://doi.org/10.30996/jpap.v9i2.8228>
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
- Apriadi, Y., Haris Wanto, A., & Amelia Novita, A. (2023). Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Kondisi Awal Collaborative Governance Dalam Pemetaan Wilayah Adat Di Kabupaten Sorong Selatan. *Jap*, 6(7), 360–367.
- Astuti, R.S., Warsono, H., & Rachim, A. (2020). Sampul Collaborative Governance. In *Collaborative Governance Dalam Perspektif Publik*.
- Denhardt, R. B., & Denhardt, J. V. (2000). The New Public Service: Serving Rather than Steering. *Public Administration Review*, 60, 549–559.
- Direktorat Jenderal Perhubungan Darat. (1996). *Pedoman Perencanaan dan Pengoperasian Fasilitas Parkir*. Andalalin DKI Jakarta. <https://doi.org/10.36040/jati.v5i1.3281>
- Firmansyah, D., Suryana, A., Rifa'i, A. A., Suherman, A., & Susetyo, D. P. (2022). Hexa Helix: Kolaborasi Quadruple Helix Dan Quintuple Helix Innovation Sebagai Solusi Untuk Pemulihan Ekonomi Pasca Covid-19. *EKUITAS (Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Keuangan)*, 6(4), 476–499. <https://doi.org/10.24034/j25485024.y2022.v6.i4.4602>
- Haryadi, D. (2019). *Jalan Dr Sudarsono Jauh dari Kriteria KTL*.

- <https://radarcirebon.disway.id/amp/87944/jalan-dr-sudarsono-jauh-dari-kriteria-ktl>
- Hood, C. (1991). A Public Management for All Seasons? *Public Administration*, 69(1), 3–19. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9299.1991.tb00779.x>
- Kemhub. (2009). *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No 22 Tahun 2009 Tentang Lalu Lintas Dan Angkutan Jalan*.
- Khumayah, S. (2021). Implementasi Perlindungan dan Pengelolaan Lingkungan Hidup untuk Peningkatan Kesejahteraan Nelayan. *Syntax Literate ; Jurnal Ilmiah Indonesia*, 6(1), 430. <https://doi.org/10.36418/syntax-literate.v6i1.2273>
- Laary, Y., Tulus, F. M. G., & Dengo, S. (2022). Implementasi Kebijakan Keamanan dan Ketertiban di Desa Baru Kecamatan Ibu Selatan Kabupaten Halmahera Barat. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 8(120), 60–67.
- Lindmark, A., Stureson, E., & Nilsson-Roos, M. (2009). *Difficulties of Collaboration for Innovation - A Study in the Öresund Region*.
- Maulana, D., & Nugroho, A. (2019). Kebijakan Publik : Cara Mudah Memahami Kebijakan Publik. In *Cv. Aa. Rizky* (Issue September).
- Mohammad Riyan Hidayatulloh. (2023). Penerapan Sanksi Pidana Terhadap Pungutan Liar Oleh Penyelenggara Parkir Ilegal. *Jurnal Legisiasia*, 15(1), 36–49. <https://doi.org/10.58350/leg.v15i1.250>
- Nurlailah, N. (2021). Implementasi Kebijakan Vaksinasi Covid-19 Di Kab. Ogan Komering Ulu. *Jurnal Dinamika*, 1(2), 59–68. <https://doi.org/10.54895/dinamika.v1i2.1135>
- Pemerintah Daerah Kota Cirebon. (2012). *PERATURAN DAERAH KOTA CIREBON NO.8 TAHUN 2012 TENTANG RENCANA TATA RUANG WILAYAH (RTRW) KOTA CIREBON*.
- Pemerintah Daerah Kota Cirebon. (2019). *PERATURAN DAERAH KOTA CIREBON NOMOR 11 TAHUN 2019 TENTANG PENYELENGGARAAN PERPARKIRAN* (pp. 1–51).
- Rusmanta, T. (2024, September). *Parkir Liar Jalan Cipto Cirebon Makin Meresahkan, Dishub Salahkan Pengelola Mall*. <https://radarcirebon.disway.id/amp/186687/parkir-liar-jalan-cipto-cirebon-makin-meresahkan-dishub-salahkan-pengelola-mall>
- Solikhin, M. (2019). Collaborative Governance Dalam Upaya Pemberdayaan Penyandang Tunagrahita Melalui Budidaya Ikan Lele di Desa Karangpahitan Kecamatan Balong Kabupaten Ponorogo. *Publika*, 7, No 7, 7. <https://jurnalmahasiswa.unesa.ac.id/index.php/publika/article/view/31135>
- Statistik, B. P. (2023). *Jumlah Kendaraan Bermotor di Kota Cirebon*. 2023. <https://jabar.bps.go.id/id/statistics-table/3/VjJ3NNGRGa3dkRk5MTIU1bVNFOTVVbmQyVURSTVFUMDkjMw==/jumlah-kendaraan-bermotor-menurut-kabupaten-kota-dan-jenis-kendaraan-di-provinsi-jawa-barat--unit---2022.html?year=2022>
- Sugiyono, D. (2013). *Metode penelitian pendidikan pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R&D*. Alfabeta.

- Syaiful, L. O. (2018). Collaborative Governance, Konsep dan aplikasi. In *Grup Penerbitan CV Budi Utama*. Deepublish.
- Tachjan. (2006). Implementasi kebijakan publik. In D. Mariana & C. Paskarina (Eds.), *Notes and Queries* (Vols. s1-IX, Issue 240). Asosiasi Ilmu Politik Indonesia (AIPi). <https://doi.org/10.1093/nq/s1-IX.240.527-h>
- Tilano, Aldi, F., & Suwitri, S. (2019). Collaborative Governance Dalam Upaya Keselamatan Lalu Lintas dan Angkutan Jalan di Kota Semarang. *Rule of Public Administration*, 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9781139175937.011>