



The Implementation of Project Based Learning (PjBL) Model Using Local Tourism Video to Improve Students' Speaking Skill of Tourism Program at SMK

Arismunandar¹, Ansar², Naniek Jusnita^{3*}

Universitas Negeri Makassar

Corresponding Author: Naniek Jusnita naniekunkhair@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: PjBL Model, Local Tourism Video, Speaking Skill

Received : 3 May

Revised : 23 June

Accepted: 17 July

©2024 Arismundar, Ansar, Jusnita: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Atribusi 4.0 Internasional](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

The low students' speaking ability in learning English on tourism concept demands the need for an innovative learning model which is the main problem in this research. The research aims to determine the effectiveness of *project based learning* (PjBL) model using local tourism videos in improving students' speaking skills. This type of research is a mixed method with qualitative and quantitative analysis design. The data collection techniques used were observation, and students' speaking tests. The data obtained were analysed descriptively and quantitatively. The results showed that the implementation of the PjBL model assisted by local tourism videos proved effective in improving students' speaking skills with the initial average *pre-test* value was 57.33 and the average post-test value was 82.85. The normality test value was 0.460 which was distributed normally while the hypothesis value was 0.05, that is mean H₀ is rejected and H_a is accepted, thus it can be concluded that there is an improvement on students' speaking ability at tourism class students through the implementation of the PjBL model using local tourism videos

INTRODUCTION

The effort to improve students' speaking skills is a challenge that must be faced by English teachers and lecturers. This is based on the essence of language learning based on the 2004 and 2006 curriculum which emphasizes on four aspects of language skills namely speaking, listening, writing and reading. Teachers are obliged to develop students' speaking skills through various means. Speaking proficiency is a priority for students and they often measure their achievement in language learning as well as their verbal proficiency potential (Arends, 2008).

Research on students' speaking ability in secondary schools, especially vocational schools that have English tourism majors, shows the inability of students to communicate using English fluently, especially at SMK Negeri 1 Tourism Department in Ternate City. Some of the facts that inhibit the speaking process identified during this initial trial are; (1) Students do not dare to express opinions, (2) hesitate to start communication so they choose to be silent. (3) Not confident so that the communication pattern is not directed. (4) Lack of vocabulary in communication (5) quickly feel bored and unmotivated when speaking learning process takes place (6) teaching methods and media used by teachers are less varied (7) teachers in presenting the material, use more printed books available at school so that speaking communication material is less in accordance with current topics or issues. The teacher uses English printed book (English for Change) which is also commonly used in other departments.

Several previous studies recognized some factors inhibit students in communicating or doing speaking activities in class. Inayah & Lisdawati, (2017), found that students have problems with motivation and self-confidence. Students are afraid of being wrong, embarrassed, anxious and lack confidence (Al Nakhalah, 2016). Learning speaking (Paakki, 2013), too grammar-oriented and theoretical, late start of learning, fear of mistakes, lack of practice and experience, and social pressure. Widyaworo (2019) added that students' speaking difficulties include linguistic and non-linguistic problems.

From the above findings, the researcher concluded that the learning process requires communication as a signal of effective and efficient interaction (Bahrani & Rahmatollah, 2008). In addition, students' opportunity to speak directly is necessary to improve their speaking skills (Liao, 2009). An effective teaching and learning process will give good results to students. In other words, decision to use an appropriate learning models, methods, strategies and techniques will help students improve their speaking skills.

Project-based learning (PjBL) is one of the learning models that can help students improve their speaking skills in a natural context where they learn through self-determined tasks with the help of teachers so that students become active in learning. According to Patton (2012) in PjBL learning model, students design their own work and plan to be done, PjBL is a model as well as a method that can make it easier for teachers to achieve learning objectives. Fragoulis (2009) in his book says that there are many advantages of using PjBL in teaching English as a foreign language, namely PjBL provides contextual and valuable learning for students, creates an optimal environment in English speaking practice, students can actively participate in learning, increases students' interest, motivation, relevance, excitement, and improves collaborative skills. PjBL also provides opportunities for students to develop skills in real conditions.

Several studies related to the application of project-based learning (PjBL) in improving students' speaking skills prove to be able to have a significant impact both at the elementary school level to higher education. Blumenfeld et al (2011) said that projects can motivate students to learn and improve cognitive abilities. Genc (2015) in his research found that by using project-based learning, students have more awareness of the environment. This approach can enhance students' creativity and provide lifelong learning. They believe the project helps them clarify environmental issues and provides practice to be part of the solution. Previous studies show that project-based learning is an option for teachers and lecturers in teaching English. However, there are not many studies that examine the relationship between project-based learning and video-assisted local tourism especially in speaking skills.

From the explanation above, it is possible for the researcher to integrate speaking learning materials in the Tourism department of SMKN 1 Ternate in an observation project of local tourism video in Ternate city. Several local tourism videos of Ternate were prepared and selected in advance by paying attention to aspects and components of speaking such as clarity in pronunciation, vocabulary, grammar, listening skills and others (Iskandarwassid & Sunendar, 2011). The selected local tourism videos of Ternate city are the nine (9) most recommended tourist destinations of Ternate city when visiting Ternate City such as, Kedaton Ternate, Sultan Ternate Mosque, Kalimata Fort, Oranje Fort, Tolukko fort, Laguna Lake, Batu Angus, Tolire Lake, and Nukila Park.

Information about these attractions is still rarely used as a learning resource in the form of material or topics in learning process in the classroom. There is research on tourism in Ternate that mostly examines aspects of tourism development strategies and factors that focus on tourist facilities, potential development of tourism arrangements, tourism potential from the economic sector, natural science studies at certain tourist attractions, environmental issues at tourist sites, etc. (Latif, 2020, Ibrahim and Basuki, 2007, Djongihi et al, 2022., Abdulhaji and Yusuf, 2016). However, there are several studies on children's storytelling ability through the field trip method (Wondal, 2019) and English language learning in improving tourism human resources for local communities at tourist attractions (Nuria & Nurfani, 2019). This shows that there is still a lack of research that integrates and utilizes regional tourism information as a source of learning in the classroom while promoting to the world regional attractions that are interesting to visit especially in learning English tourism. Vocabularies, tourism terms and objects that were identified by students through tourism videos are then converted into English. This learning process creates an interesting, challenging, motivating, collaborative, and joyful language learning atmosphere and experience for students.

Through the implementation of the PjBL model assisted by local tourism videos in learning English, especially speaking competence, it is able to create an effective and interesting learning model that does not only focus on English studies or dialogs taken in printed book but the material content in the video provides extensive information about tourism spots in Ternate City that need to be visited and explored further the natural beauty and tourism potential as an attraction for tourist visitors both domestically and abroad. Historical, culinary or marine tourism can stimulate students' speaking skills naturally, motivate students to think critically, build team togetherness, make decisions and be

responsible for presenting the results of their work. So that the PjBL learning model assisted by regional tourism videos can be developed more varied, creative, innovative and interesting for students. The aim of the research is to know the effectiveness of Project Based Learning (PjBL) model using local tourism video in improving students' speaking skill.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Speaking Learning Concept

An effective way to express ideas and find out what others think is through language communication. This opinion is in line with the view in the context of English language teaching that speaking is an important skill that second or foreign language learners must have (Ur, 2009; Hughes, 2012; Palmer, 2014). Speaking ability is largely regarded as the key determinant of students' success in learning English (Yuliati, 2010). According to Ramlannarie (2011), speaking is a process of thinking and reasoning so that one's speech can be received and understood well by others or listeners. Speaking is closely related to listening skills. Based on the opinions of language experts related to speaking, it can be concluded that speaking learning is the activity of conveying a message or information to others in oral form. This learning will be more successful if someone often does practice in pronunciation before they use language.

Obstacles in Learning Speaking

Despite the need and an importance to have adequate speaking skills, some problems may be faced by students from mastering speaking skills. A study conducted by Hosni (2015) in Oman revealed that the obstacles to students' speaking mastery are seen in the lack of vocabulary, linguistic difficulties, using the source language more, and fear or anxiety. Cutrone (2009) and Saglame (2013) also found that anxiety is one factor that hinders students in using a second language. Furthermore, a study conducted in Pakistan by Bilal et al. (2013) reported that poor listening facilities, low learner interest in improving their language skills, and an education system that does not focus on speaking skills are the main speaking barriers.

The findings of such studies are also found in Indonesia which shows that low learner motivation (Syafii 2011) and inadequate student vocabulary, as well as poor student pronunciation (Yuliati, 2010) are the main factors contributing to students' speaking barriers. A recent study conducted by Haidara (2016) found that psychological factors such as fear of making mistakes, feelings of embarrassment, hesitation, and lack of confidence were affected speaking performance.

Speaking Ability

Speaking ability is the ability to express opinions or thoughts and feelings to a person or group orally, either face to face or at a distance. Morris (1938) explains that speaking is a natural means of communication between members of society to express thoughts and as a form of social behaviour. While Wilkin (2012) states that the purpose of teaching English today is to speak. Furthermore, Wilkin (2002) stated that speaking skill is the ability to compose sentences because communication occurs through sentences to display

different behaviours that vary from different societies. Based on the description above, it can be concluded that speaking ability is the skill in expressing an opinion, thoughts and feelings to communicate with others about English.

The factors of English speaking ability according to Soekamto (1992) and Krashen (2002) are divided into two, namely: internal and external factors. Internal factors are everything potential within the person, such as character, temperament, talent, way of thinking, belief, attention, motivation, perception, student personality and intelligence level. External factors are everything outside the person, such as the level of education, teachers, habits, interests, talents and the environment. The creation of the environment is an important part of the learning process.

Project Based Learning (PjBL) in Learning Speaking.

Project-based learning (PjBL) is one of the methods that can help students improve their speaking skills in a natural context where students learn through self-determined tasks with the help of teachers so that students become active in learning. According to Patton (2012) in the PjBL method, students design their own work and plan of activity, PjBL is a method that can make it easier for teachers to achieve learning objectives.

The PjBL method also provides an opportunity for students to develop abilities in real conditions. Fauziati (2014) said that the use of the PjBL method gives students the opportunity to work on the tasks given so that they not only learn but also practice English and develop various other important skills such as teamwork, critical thinking, and presentation. By using project based learning, learners can be stimulated to develop and improve their English skills so that they can use the language fluently, appropriately and confidently. They can also improve their decision-making skills.

The Use of Video in Learning Speaking

Video is one type of audio visual media. Audio visual media is media that relies on the sense of hearing and the sense of sight. Arsad et al, (2011) explain that videos are images in frames, where frame by frame is projected through the projector lens mechanically so that the screen looks like a live picture. Video is one type of audio-visual media that can describe an object that moves together with natural sound or appropriate sound. The ability of video to depict live images and sound gives it its own charm. Videos can present information, describe processes, explain complex concepts, teach skills, shorten or extend time, and influence attitudes. Anderson, (1987: 104) suggests several objectives of learning using video media which include cognitive, affective, and psychomotor objectives.

Learning of Local Tourism Content

Local potential is an environment that is close to students. The experiences, and knowledge they had have are very meaningful, because students already have an initial picture of cognitive concepts earlier. Through learning process, the teacher as a facilitator, and environment information as a medium, it will develop students' cognitive, attitudes and behaviour. The government constitution number 20, 2003 states that the curriculum at all levels and types of education are developed with the principle of diversification in

accordance with the education unit, local potential, and students. Ministerial Regulation 22 of 2006 emphasises that regional potential can be utilised by utilising the surrounding environment as a learning resource and learning laboratory. A meaningful learning outcome will be obtained for students, (Winaryati, 2018, 2012).

The Implementation of PjBL Model in Teaching and Learning Speaking through Local Tourism Videos.

The Project Based Learning (PjBL) model is one of the innovations in learning speaking. PjBL aims to train students to think critically, creatively, rationally, actively and communicatevly, and improve students' understanding of the material taught and provide real experience. The advantage of PjBL is that projects can be selected or developed to achieve certain learning outcomes. The goal is that students are able to have independence and skills in completing the tasks they face. The research concluded that PjBL is proven and tested as a learning model that is able to foster student independence, especially in learning base project (Wena, 2014). In speaking lessons, project-based learning has contributed to develop students' ability on personal skilled. Students become more creative, critical thinking, collaborative, communicative and technological. Then, in the aspect of oral communication, project-based learning can increase the acquisition of vocabulary in English, practice pronunciation in English, accustom students to convey ideas in English, and train students' confidence, so that they can communicate orally using English.

In English learning speaking activities, there were six steps of syntax in PjBL implementation, namely: 1) Orientating students to the problem, 2) Organising students to learn, 3) Guiding student investigation individually or in groups, 4) Carrying out and Monitoring Projects, 5) Testing Results (Presentation), 6) Evaluating and reflecting on learning. The use of local tourism video in learning process is an important part of the curriculum. The local tourism videos used in this research were video that tells, narrates, illustrates the situation or condition of tourism in Ternate City. The implementation of PjBL to improve students' speaking using local tourism videos is a development of English learning model that provides insight and information on history, culinary, panorama, and local wisdom content of tourism directly, real, real, updated, and information about local tourism in North Maluku.

METHODS

The research used mixed methods, quantitative and qualitative design. The sampling technique used non probability sampling with purposive sampling. The research subjects were 21 students of tourism class XI. The research instruments were observation and speaking test (pre-test and post-test). Observation was used to identified the process of PjBL implementation using local tourism video during the teaching and learning process. Pre-test and post test were used to know students speaking competence before and after the implementation of PjBL model using local tourism video. This experimental research has used *One-Group Pretes Prossttes Desig.*

Tabel 1. One-Group Pre-test and Post-test Design

Class	Pretest	Posttest	Posttest
Exsperimen	O ₁	X ₁	O ₂

Description:

X : Treatment using project based learning model

O1 : Pre-test of experiment class before treatment

O2 : Final test (Post-test) of experiment class after treatment

The analysis used is descriptive analysis of SPSS version 21 to test the hypothesis. Descriptive analysis aims to provide an overview of students' speaking ability tests. The students' speaking ability test is then measured based on the speaking assessment rubric which includes five aspects of speaking such as, pronunciation, grammar, vocabulary, fluency and comprehension.

The students' speaking skills were obtained from the recording of the students' speaking practice process carried out in the pre-test and post-test activities.

RESULTS

The implementation of PjBL model using local tourism videos is focused on improving speaking skills in English language learning at the tourism department. Speaking aspects evaluated are pronunciation, fluency, vocabulary, grammar, and comprehension. The process of applying this learning model refers to the PjBL syntax which consists of six steps (The George Lucas Institutional Foundation), namely 1) orienting students to the problem, 2) organizing students to learn, 3) guiding individual or group student investigations, 4) implementing and monitoring project, 5) testing results (Presentation), 6) and evaluating and reflecting. The following are students speaking test result of pre-test and post test and the phases or stages in applying PjBL syntax using local tourism videos.

Pre-test and Post-test results of students' speaking ability

After implementing the PjBL learning model using local tourism videos in students' speaking, the result of score post-test showed an increase with an average value of 82.85. The data description of the pre-test and post-test results can be seen in the following table.

Table 2. Pre-test and Post-Test Results of Students' Speaking Ability

	N	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Mean
	Statistic	Score	Score	Score	Score
Pre-test	21	31	44	76	57.33
Post-tes	21	16	76	92	82.85

The table above shows that the highest score in the pre-test was 76 and in the post-test was 92. While the lowest score of the pre-test was 44 and the post test was 76. The average value of the pre-test was 57.33 while the average value of the post test was 82.85. From the data description above, it can be concluded

that there is an increase on students' speaking ability with the implementation of PjBL model using local tourism videos. Normality data is calculated using SPSS 21 with One sample Kolmogorov Smirnov analysis with the test criteria is if the significant level $(p) > \alpha = 0.05$ then the data comes from a normally distributed sample, and vice versa if the significant rate $(p) < \alpha = 0.05$ then the data is not normally distributed. The results of the normality test can be seen in table 2 below.

Tabel 3. Score of Normality Test

Variabel	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
Speaking Competence	20	0.460

Table 3 of data obtained significant 0.460 thus the data is normally distributed. Hypothesis testing is carried out to determine the truth of the proposed hypothesis. Hypothesis testing is also calculated using SPSS 21 with paired sample T test analysis. The results of hypothesis testing using paired sample T test analysis can be seen in table 3.

Tabel 4. Score of Hypothesis *Paired Sample T Test*

Data	Analisis Score
Sig. (2-tailed)	0.05
Df	20

Based on the results of the analysis obtained a significant level 0.05, then H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted, so it can be concluded that there is an increase on students' speaking ability at Tourism class with the implementation of the PjBL model using local tourism videos.

Phases of PjBL syntax

There are some syntaxes that must be followed in implementing this project-based learning;

- 1) Pre-project: At this stage the teacher designs the project description, lays the foundation basis of the project, prepares media and various learning resources, and prepares learning conditions.
- 2) Phase 1: identifying problems, at this stage, students make observations of certain objects. Based on the results of these observations, students identified problems and formulate problems in the form of questions. Students were given some questions about tourist attractions that have been visited in Ternate.

Sample of guided questions for students:

- ✓ Where is the favorite tourism place in Ternate?
- ✓ What is the best spot in that place?
- ✓ How do we go there?
- ✓ When will be the best time to visit?
- ✓ Why people visit that place?

Students answered questions using English combined with Indonesian. Students responded base on real experiences. Teacher gave appreciation to students' answers.

- 3) Phase 2: Creating a project design and implementation schedule, at this stage, students begin to design the project collaboratively, the design also includes scheduling and other preparations. Students were divided into groups of 4-5 people. The teacher illustrates the benefits of the material/learning taken from real life conditions. Explains the steps of the project activity. Conveys the learning objectives. In working groups, students are given an explanation of the project. The theme of the project is 'The Wonderful of Ternate'. Students compose dialog text based on the tourism video played to be used as a work project. Students prepare materials such as A4 paper, pen, cellphone (access google translation). Translate Indonesian vocabulary (previously identified) to English. Determine roles in conversation/dialogue activities. Students download the video through youtube link. Students choose a video that will be used as a project with the basic question "What kinds of tourism places are mostly visited in Ternate?". Students observe, identify, understand the vocabulary, objects, and expressions contained in the selected tourism video.
- 4) Phase 3: Developing a work plan, at this stage students conducted initial research as a basic model of the product to be developed. Students determined the project according to the directions and steps in the preparation of the project design such as selecting and determining the tourist video. Observe, identify and record objects in the form of people or objects as well as conversational vocabulary and expressions contained in the video. Students translate the vocabulary, objects or things seen in the video from Indonesian to English. Students discuss to design a conversation project, determine roles in conversation activities according to the title of the conversation. Students compose a dialog using good and correct English based on appropriate grammar. Students practice the dialog by correcting their friends' pronunciation.
- 5) Phase 4: Draft (Project Implementation and Monitoring). At this stage, students begin to create the initial product as planned and the results of their observations. Students in groups practiced conversations by paying attention to appropriate speaking aspects fluently. Students gave corrections to each other during the practicing process related to pronunciation and other information according to the notes during the observation process, identification and understanding the context local tourism video. Students developed a project plan, and managed presentation duration.
- 6) Phase 5: measuring, assessing and improving the product. This activity is carried out by asking for opinions or criticism from group members or teacher. Students composed the presentation dialog, delivering the project results in the form of speaking practice with the team, each of whom has received a role in the dialog. Students recorded/corrected the presentation process using notes and videos as project documentation.

- 7) Phase 6: product finalization and publication. This phase is the last stage in the implementation of the project, the finalized product must be published. Students analyze the results of the project that has been presented by playing back the video footage taken during the presentation. Students evaluate the results of their presentation by giving emotic stickers on the peer evaluation sheet. Students express their opinions regarding the effectiveness of the application of the PjBL method through regional tourism videos to train their speaking.

DISCUSSION

The implementation of the PjBL model using local tourism videos to improve students' speaking skills developed as a whole was carried out well. The data of pre-test is 57,33 and post-test is 82,85, there were an improve of students' speaking after implementing PjBL model. Although it is a class majoring in tourism, the difficulty or obstacles in understanding the concept of tourism students still high. Especially in historical tourism, students feel that the terms used are quite difficult because they are related to the year of the event, the founding figures, and still minimal direct visits such as to the colonial fortress, the Ternate sultanate palace museum and several historical locations in Ternate City. From the results of selected topic in project design, students prefer marine tourism, namely Jikomalamo beach, rather than culinary tours and historical tours of the Toloko fort that are already available. Students admit that the vocabulary or English terms of beach tourism are easier to understand. In line with this, the utilization of tourist sites to support learning facilities is strongly recommended by the government as explained that the utilization of local potential, can be done by optimizing the surrounding environment, including natural attractions, and artificial tourism used as a learning resource (Permen No. 22 of 2006).

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The local tourism material shown through the video arouses students' interest in the topic (apperception) and encourages students to think critically. Build students' cooperation and communication in groups. Develop students' authentic inquiry skills, by identifying real problems, looking for sources of information in tourist videos. experience to investigate (try), foster the ability to analyze (find their own relationship between real conditions and the problems faced), build an attitude of sharing and cooperation, develop communication skills, foster the ability to make decisions, develop the ability to display work using media, develop the ability to analyze project results and decision-making skills. From the implementation of the PjBL model, there is an increase in students' speaking ability. Thus, learning syntax of the PjBL model using local tourism videos can be applied to improve students' speaking skills in English learning.

FURTHER STUDY

Next research can explore more broadly on English language skill aspects other than speaking such (writing, reading, listening) by using local tourism concept. Not only in language study but also in scient issue that empowers local tourism.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I would like appreciate high gratitude to my team Arismunandar and Ansar who had given valuable contribution on their critical thought, analysis, advises, and recommendation for article writing improvement. Also, for IJIS publisher who has provide opportunity for us to publish the article.

REFERENCES

- Arends, R. 1997. *Classroom Instructional and Management*. New York : A Division of the McGraww-Hill Companies.
- Abdulhaji, S., & Yusuf, I. S. H. (2016). Pengaruh Atraksi, Aksesibilitas, dan Fasilitas Terhadap Citra Objek Wisata Danau Tolire Besar di Kota Ternate. *Jurnal Penelitian Humano*, 7(2), 135
- Al Nakhalah, A. 2016. Problems and Difficulties of Speaking that Encounter English Language Students at Al Quds Open University. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention*.
- Bahrani, T & Soltani, R. 2008. How to Teach Speaking Skill?. *ELT Journaletj. Oxfordjournals. Org*, Vol 62, Iss 2, Pp 131-138.
- Blumentfeld, P. C., Soloway, E., Marx, R. W., Krajcik, J. S., Guzdial, M., & Palincsar, A. 2011. Motivating project-based learning: Sustaining the doing, supporting the learning. *Educational Psychologist*, 26(3-4), 369-398.
- Djongihi, A., Adjam, S., & Salam, R. 2022. Dampak Pembuangan Sampah Di Pesisir Pantai Terhadap Lingkungan Sekitar (Studi Kasus Masyarakat Payahe Kecamatan Oba Kota Tidore Kepulauan). *Jurnal Geocivic*, 5(1).
- Fragoulis, L. 2009. Project-Based Learning in Teaching of English as A Foreign Language in Greek Primary Schools: From Theory to Practice. (A Journal). *English Language Teaching*. Vol. 2 September 2009.
- Genc, M. 2015. The project-based learning approach in environmental education. *International Research in Geographical and Environmental Education*, 24(2), 105-117. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10382046.2014.993169>
- Inayah, R., & Lisdawati, I. 2017. Exploring Students' Difficulties in Speaking English and Their Attitude In Speaking English. *Acuity: Journal of English Language Pedagogy, Literature and Culture*, 2(1), pp.12-23
- Iskandarwassid, dan Sunendar, H.D. 2011. *Strategi Pembelajaran Bahasa*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Latif, J.M. 2020. Pengembangan Ruang Kawasan Tepi Pantai Untuk Rekreasi Dalam Mendukung Kota Ternate Sebagai Waterfront City. *Jurnal Online Mahasiswa (JOM) Bidang Perencanaan Wilayah & ota*. Vol 1, No 1. 2020.
- Liao, G. 2009. Improvement of Speaking Ability through Interrelated Skills School of Foreign Languages, Sichuan University of Science & Engineering Zigong 643000, Sichuan, China. *English language teaching*, 2(3).

- Nuria, H & Nurfani. 2019. Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Dalam Meningkatkan Sumber Daya Manusia (Sdm) Pariwisata Masyarakat Lokal Pada Objek Wisata Cengkeh Afo Kota Ternate. *Tekstual: Volume 17 (2) 2019 P-ISSN: 1693-1041; E-ISSN: 2686-0392*
- Paakki, H. 2013. Difficulties in Speaking English and Perceptions of Accents: A Comparative Study of Finnish and Japanese Adult Learners of English. Unpublished Master's Thesis, University of Eastern Finland
- Patton, A. 2012. *Work That Matters: The Teacher's Guide to Project-Based Learning*. The Paul Hamlyn Foundation.
- Wondal, R. 2019. Meningkatkan Kemampuan Bercerita Anak Melalui Metode Karya Wisata. *Jurnal Pendidikan Usia Dini* Doi: <https://doi.org/10.21009/jpud.091>